Title: Research on the effect of liquid-liquid doping processes on the doped powders and microstructures of W-ZrO2(Y) alloys

Article Type: Full Length Article

Keywords: Hydrothermal process; Azeotropic distillation; ODS-W; Zirconia; Phase evolution.

Corresponding Author: Dr. fangnao xiao,

Corresponding Author's Institution: Univ. Bourgogne Franche-Comté, FEMTO-ST Institute

First Author: fangnao xiao

Order of Authors: fangnao xiao; Thierry Barriere; Gang Cheng; Qiang Miao; shizhong wei; Shiwei zuo; Yanping Yang; Liujie xu

Abstract: In previous researches, there are few studies on the mechanisms involved in liquid-liquid doping techniques for preparing oxide particle doped tungsten powders. In this research, based on different polytungstate species, three liquid-liquid doping techniques for synthesizing different doped precursor powders were proposed and compared. The extremely homogeneous hexagonal (NH4)0.33WO3*H2O microspheres and flaky (NH4)6H2W12O40*5H2O were synthesized. The synthesis mechanisms of precursors, the doping processes and reaction mechanisms for preparing yttrium-stabilised ZrO2 in ternary liquid phase system were discussed. The doped powder prepared through azeotropic distillation method exhibits higher quality due to the highly dispersed ZrO2(Y) phase uniformly distributed in flaky precursor, and the corresponding alloy possesses more excellent microstructure and mechanical properties. The proposed azeotropic distillation method offers a general pathway and is readily adapted to large-scale industrial production of high-quality oxide particle doped W powders.
Aug. 26 2020

To
Prof. Li Jin, PhD

Editor-in-Chief: Journal of Alloys and Compounds

Dear Sir,

I am pleased to submit the revised version of our research article entitled “Research on the effect of liquid-liquid doping processes on the doped powders and microstructures of W-ZrO$_2$(Y) alloys” for publication in Journal of Alloys and Compounds. The reviewers’ comments are addressed in the present draft and the responses to these comments are appended herewith for your reference.

We believe that the improved version of the manuscript is now appropriate for publication.

This manuscript has not been published nor is under consideration for publication elsewhere. We have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Thank you for your consideration.

Fangnao Xiao

2020/8/26
With the development of increasingly precise powder metallurgy production techniques, there are also increased demands for powders with high quality. However, the conventional ODS-W/ODS-Mo alloy powders were mainly prepared through solid-solid mixing pure W powders and oxide particles, or solid-liquid mixing soluble melts- salt and insoluble tungsten salt. These two doping methods have serious drawbacks as mentioned in the Introduction of our manuscript.

According to a recent study in the journal Nature, nanostructured high-strength ODS-Mo alloys with unprecedented tensile ductility were prepared through liquid-liquid technique. The reaction mechanisms of soluble raw material and composition of precursor with a special coated structure were investigated in detail. However, for the ODS-W powders, few researches referred to these areas. It leads to the tedious works and the poor repeatability during preparing ODS-W powders.

In the present research, we firstly analyzed the polytungstate species in different solution environments and then proposed three novel liquid-liquid doping techniques for synthesizing three extremely homogeneous morphologies of precursors, which correspond to doped h-(NH₄)₀.₃₃WO₃•H₂O, doped ammonium paratungstate and doped ammonium metatungstate powders, respectively. Moreover, given that the characteristics of precursor powders, such as size, morphology and phase composition, play an important effect on properties of doping W powders, we focused on investigating the doping mechanisms of three novel liquid- liquid doping processes, the formation mechanism of precursor with different morphology and composition, doping process of yttrium stabilized ZrO₂ in ternary liquid phase system and the morphology and composition evolution during dry /reduction. Through comparative analysis, azeotropic distillation method was proposed as a general pathway and reasonable guidance for large-scale industrial production of high-quality ODS-W powders (such as La₂O₃-W, Y₂O₃-W and CeO₂-W) using liquid-liquid doping technique.
Sep. 13, 2020

To

Prof. Li Jin, PhD

Editor: Journal of Alloys and Compounds

Dear Sir,

I am pleased to submit the revised version of our research article entitled “Research on the effect of liquid-liquid doping processes on the doped powders and microstructures of W-ZrO₂(Y) alloys”, which has been supported by the EIPHI Graduate School (contract ANR-17-EURE-0002). The reviewer’s comment is addressed in the present draft and the response to these comment is appended herewith for your reference.

We believe that the improved version of the manuscript is now appropriate for publication in Journal of Alloys and Compounds.

This manuscript has not been published nor under consideration for publication elsewhere. We have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Thank you for your consideration.
Response to Editor and Reviewer Comments:

Ref. No.: JALCOM-D-20-04481R2

Title: Research on the effect of liquid-liquid doping processes on the doped powders and microstructures of W-ZrO$_2$(Y) alloys

We greatly appreciate the work of the editor and the referee in reviewing this manuscript. We have addressed the issue indicated in the review reports. The suggestion of the reviewer has been taken into account in the revised manuscript.

Reviewer 1:
Comments 1: A suitable unite should be chosen for the lattice parameters (a,b,c) in the revised version.
Response: Thank you for your suggestion. We have inserted the unit in table 3, that is Å marked in red in below table and revised manuscript, respectively.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Powder processing technology</th>
<th>Crystallite sizes(Å)</th>
<th>FWHM</th>
<th>a (Å)</th>
<th>b (Å)</th>
<th>c (Å)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HM</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>0.154</td>
<td>7.600</td>
<td>7.600</td>
<td>7.600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM</td>
<td>1264</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>14.944</td>
<td>14.944</td>
<td>14.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZM</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>0.181</td>
<td>18.080</td>
<td>18.080</td>
<td>18.080</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Highlights

1. Three novel liquid–liquid doping technique for preparing precursors were proposed.
2. Extremely homogeneous microspherical and flaky precursors were synthesized.
3. Synthesis mechanism of three precursors were investigated in detail, respectively.
4. Reaction mechanisms for synthesizing cubic ZrO$_2$ in ternary liquid system were discussed.
Credit Author Statement

Shizhong Wei: Methodology; Qiang Miao and Shizhong Wei: Analysis; Fangnao Xiao, Yanping Yang, Shiwei Zuo: Experiments, Writing-Original draft preparation; Thierry Barriere and Gang Cheng: Methodology, Analysis, Writing-Reviewing; All authors: Discussions.
Declaration of interests

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.
Research on the effect of liquid-liquid doping processes on the
doped powders and microstructures of W-ZrO$_2$(Y) alloys

Fangnao Xiao$^{a,b,c}$, Thierry Barriere$^a$, Gang Cheng$^b$, Qiang Miao$^{c*}$, Shizhong Wei$^{d*}$, Shiwei Zuo$^c$, Yanping Yang$^d$, Liujie Xu$^{d*}$

$^a$ Univ. Bourgogne Franche-Comté, FEMTO-ST Institute, CNRS/UFC/ENSMM/UTBM, Department of Applied Mechanics, 25000 Besançon, France

$^b$ INSA CVL, Univ. Tours, Univ. Orléans, LaMé, 3 rue de la Chocolaterie, BP 3410, 41034 Blois Cedex, France

$^c$ College of Material Science and Technology, Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics, 29 Yudao Street, Nanjing 210000, China

$^d$ National Joint Engineering Research Center for abrasion control and molding of metal materials, Henan University of Science and Technology, Luoyang 471003, China

*Corresponding author

Fangnao Xiao

E-mail: fangnao.xiao@univ-fcomte.fr

Full postal address:

FEMTO-ST Institute, Departement of Applied Mechanics, 24 chemin de l'épitaphe, 25000, Besançon, France

Tel.: +33381666000
Abstract

In previous researches, there are few studies on the mechanisms involved in liquid-liquid doping techniques for preparing oxide particle doped tungsten powders. In this research, based on different polytungstate species, three liquid–liquid doping techniques for synthesizing different doped precursor powders were proposed and compared. The extremely homogeneous hexagonal \((\text{NH}_4)_0.33\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{H}_2\text{O}\) microspheres and flaky \((\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}\cdot5\text{H}_2\text{O}\) were synthesized. The synthesis mechanisms of precursors, the doping processes and reaction mechanisms for preparing yttrium-stabilised \(\text{ZrO}_2\) in ternary liquid phase system were discussed. The doped powder prepared through azeotropic distillation method exhibits higher quality due to the highly dispersed \(\text{ZrO}_2(Y)\) phase uniformly distributed in flaky precursor, and the corresponding alloy possesses more excellent microstructure and mechanical properties. The proposed azeotropic distillation method offers a general pathway and is readily adapted to large-scale industrial production of high-quality oxide particle doped W powders.

Keywords: Hydrothermal process; Azeotropic distillation; ODS-W; Zirconia; Phase evolution.

1. Introduction

In recent decades, tungsten, an indispensable material, has been widely used in national defence, aerospace, metal processing, mining and oil drilling industries [1, 2]. However, tungsten has a relatively high ductile–brittle transition temperature (DBTT) and a low recrystallization temperature [3]. Thermally stable oxide particles, such as
La$_2$O$_3$, Y$_2$O$_3$, HfO$_2$, ZrO$_2$ and CeO$_2$ dispersed in the tungsten matrix, can effectively inhibit recovery/recrystallization at high temperatures and decrease the DBTT, thereby improving the mechanical properties of tungsten alloy [4–9]. Therefore, the researches on the oxide dispersion-strengthened tungsten (ODS-W) have attracted considerable attention [10, 11].

The mechanical properties of tungsten materials are determined by the quality of tungsten powder to some extent [12–16]. Fu et al. [17] and Gamble et al. [18] found that the morphology and dimension of particles significantly influence powder flowability, dimension accuracy, surface roughness and mechanical properties of the manufactured tungsten parts. Impurities in tungsten powders (e.g. O and N) segregate at grain boundaries (GBs), decreasing their cohesion and forming low-ductility tungsten alloys [19]. The agglomerates of tungsten powder particles affect the density and porosity of the tungsten products [12]. Therefore, the requirements for synthesis of high-quality powders (e.g. surface morphology, particle size and size distribution) have increased [20].

In the past several years, liquid–liquid (L–L) methods involving molecular-level doping are used to prepare tungsten powder [27–34]. However, the doped tungsten powders in previous researches exhibit high degree of agglomeration, such as W–Y$_2$O$_3$ powders [27, 32], W–Re powders [28], W–Sc$_2$O$_3$ powders [29] and W–As powders [34]. A higher degree of agglomeration may lead to the tough calcination and reduction process [28], inadequate reduction, non-uniform distribution of doping phase [30], high energy consumption and strictly controlled sintering process (i.e. the
higher pressing loading, sintering temperature and advanced equipment) [31-33].

Moreover, the usual problem of agglomeration in powder is not conducive to the
development process of net-shape accuracy powder metallurgy manufacturing, which
requires higher flowability, purity and uniform distribution of doping phase.

In above studies, selected ammonium metatungstate (AMT) was selected as raw
material. However, AMT, a polytungstic acid, exhibits high sensitivity to acidity [35],
resulting in a complicated reaction mechanism during synthesis of precursor powders.
Moreover, highly soluble AMT is prone to moisture absorption and caking and forms
difficult agglomerates during water evaporation [36]. However, in previous researches,
the precursor powders’ synthesis, solution acidity, reaction mechanism and
refinement mechanism of precursor agglomeration have not been investigated in
detail, resulting in the tedious works and poor repeatability. As reported in literatures
[37, 38], the physical characteristics of the precursor powder, the phase evolution
process and the evolution mechanisms greatly affect the resultant reduced powders.
However, limited studies have focused on the synthesis of doped tungsten powder.
Especially, in the preparation of W-ODS alloy involving liquid-liquid doping
processes, there are few researches referring to the influence of precursor powders on
the properties of powders and alloys. Dong et al. [22] used a wet chemical process to
synthesize nanosized composite powder and then sintered W-Y2O3 alloy by spark
plasma sintering process. Nevertheless, there was no description about the influence
of precursor powders. Y. Z. Hu et al. [27] studied the effect of yttrium doping on the
formation and stability of β-tungsten powder based on the spray drying process. They
focused on the phase and morphology evolution during all stages of the thermal treatment process. However, as usual, the solid spherical structures in precursor remained in the reduced powders. In the research of Xu et al. [31], the hydrothermal-hydrogen reduction process was employed to prepare the La$_2$O$_3$ doped ultra-fine tungsten powders. It indicated that the hydrothermal process was the most appropriate method to obtain a high-quality powder. However, the adopted raw materials of Na$_2$WO$_4$·2H$_2$O and HCl may lead to the introduction of Na$^+$ and Cl$^-$ impurities.

In this research, given that that different polytungstate species exist in aqueous solutions with different acidities [35, 39], we propose three L–L doping methods such as hydrothermal method (denoted as HM), sol-gel method (denoted as SM) and azeotropic distillation method (denoted as ZM) for synthesis of doped hexagonal (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·H$_2$O, doped APT and doped AMT powders, respectively. The synthesis mechanisms, phase evolution and evolution mechanisms of the three precursor powders containing W and Zr phases were investigated in detail. Through the comparison of physical properties of the reduced doped tungsten powders and sintered alloys, ZM can prepared yttrium-stabilised zirconia [ZrO$_2$(Y)] doped tungsten powders [W-ZrO$_2$(Y)] with higher quality than the products of the two other methods. Finally, the relationships between doping mechanisms with the microstructures and mechanical properties of sintered alloys were discussed in detail.

2. Experimental procedure

2.1 Preparation of samples
The soluble raw materials used for the synthesis of the doped tungsten powders were ammonium metatungstate \((\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}\cdot\text{5H}_2\text{O}; \text{grade AR; AMT})\), zirconium nitrate \([\text{Zr(NO}_3)_4\cdot\text{5H}_2\text{O}; \text{grade AR}]/\text{zirconium oxychloride octahydrate (ZrOCl}_2\cdot\text{8H}_2\text{O}; \text{grade AR})\) and yttrium nitrate \((\text{Y(NO}_3)_3\cdot\text{6H}_2\text{O}; \text{grade AR})\). The chemical compositions of the samples were listed in Table 1.

Table 1 The chemical composition of the samples. (wt. %)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>W</th>
<th>ZrO₂</th>
<th>Y₂O₃</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Z₁₀</td>
<td>98.873</td>
<td>1.0</td>
<td>0.127</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Z₅₀</td>
<td>94.370</td>
<td>5.0</td>
<td>0.630</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In this research, three L-L doping techniques, which are HM, SM and ZM, respectively were adopted. Fig. 1 shows the preparation process of doped tungsten powders and tungsten alloys.

In HM, \((\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}\cdot\text{5H}_2\text{O}\) was dissolved in distilled water and then the pH of the original solution was adjusted below 1.0 by adding nitric acid solution under stirring. The clear solution was transferred into Teflon-lined stainless steel autoclave. Specific amounts of \(\text{Zr(NO}_3)_4\cdot\text{5H}_2\text{O}\) and \(\text{Y(NO}_3)_3\cdot\text{6H}_2\text{O}\) were mixed with a contain amount of urea and then placed into another autoclave. The autoclaves were sealed and heated until the desired temperature of 170 °C. After the reaction, the autoclaves were naturally cooled to room temperature. Distilled water was added to the mixture of the two reaction products under continuous stirring using an electric mixer for 2 h. The mixture was filtered to obtain precursor powders. The preparation process of HM, was described elsewhere [40].
For powder prepared through ZM and SM, commercial ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O, Y(NO$_3$)$_3$·6H$_2$O and (NH$_4$)$_6$H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$·xH$_2$O were separately dissolved in distilled water. The Y(NO$_3$)$_3$ solution was added slowly to the ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O solution under stirring. The mixture was homogenised under stirring for 20 min and gradually added to the (NH$_4$)$_6$H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$·xH$_2$O solution while stirring for 3 h at room temperature to prepare the initial solution. In ZM, the initial solution was heated to 93 °C with continuous stirring until precipitates were formed on the solution surface. The mixture of alcohol and butanol was used as azeotropic agent and added to the initial solution. The solution was then heated continuously until the precursor powder was formed. In SM, the pH of the initial solution was adjusted to 7.0 by adding ammonia solution under stirring to obtain sols. Polyethylene glycol (PEG-1540) was used as dispersant to prevent agglomeration. The SM precursor powder was synthesized through the same procedures with ZM. Schematic graph of azeotropic distillation and sol-gel apparatus was shown in Fig. 2 [39].

The three different precursor powders were dried overnight at 90°C and calcined at 600°C for 4 h in a muffle furnace. The same calcination temperature as in previous study was applied [40]. The calcined powders were reduced by hydrogen reduction process at 900 °C for 2 h to obtain the reduced doped powders. H$_2$ atmosphere were conventionally applied as a reducing atmosphere to reduce the oxide tungsten as reported in [27-34].

The reduced doped powders were pressed into rubber mould at 350 MPa for 30 min by using cold isostatic pressing to obtain cylindrical billets of Φ20 mm × 30 mm.
The samples were then placed into medium-frequency induction sintering furnace under a hydrogen atmosphere (H₂). The sintering was conducted at 2400 °C for 4 h to prepare W-ZrO₂(Y) alloys. The sintering kinetics were proposed for the same doped tungsten material by Luoyang aikemai tungsten & molybdenum Technology Co. LTD., in China [3].

![Diagram of the sintering process]

Fig. 1. Illustration of the process for the preparation of doped tungsten powders and tungsten alloys.

1. (NH₄)ₓH₂W₁₂O₄₀·xH₂O solution
2. ZrOCl₂·8H₂O /
3. Zr(NO₃)₄·solution
4. Y(NO₃)₃·6H₂O solution

- Stirring
- Mixed solution
- Precipitate
- Drying
- Roasting
- Calcined powders
- Testing specimens
- Machining
- Sintered billets
- Sintering
- Compacted billets
- Pressing
- Reduced powders
- Reduction
- Sintering billets
- Compacted billets
- Pressing
- Reduced powders
- Sintering
- Machining
- Testing specimens

(1) - Electric-heated thermostatic water bath
(2) - Mercurial thermometer
(3) - Digital stirring
(4) - Beaker
2.2 Measurement and analysis

Particle size distribution was evaluated in the aqueous phase of the prepared powders by using the Mastersizer-2000 laser diffraction particle size analyser. The span value ($\psi$) indicates the particle size distribution of the powder and was calculated using Eq. (1) [12].

$$\psi = (D_{90} - D_{10})/2D_{50}$$  \hspace{1cm} (1)

where $\psi$ is the span value, and $D_{10}$, $D_{50}$ and $D_{90}$ are the corresponding particle sizes when the cumulative particle size distribution percentages reach 10%, 50% and 90%, respectively.

The oxygen content in these powders was determined by a nitrogen/oxygen/hydrogen determination instrument (TCH-600, LECO). Specific surface area (SSA) was measured with a BET surface area analysis instrument (Autosorb-1, Quantachrome, USA). The average particle sizes of the doped tungsten powders were calculated based on the BET specific surface area by using the following equation [41]:

$$d_{BET} = 6/(S_{BET} \cdot \rho_{Theory})$$  \hspace{1cm} (2)

where $d_{BET}$ is the average particle size, $S_{BET}$ is the specific surface area of the powder and $\rho_{Theory}$ is the theoretical density of tungsten (i.e. 19.3 g/cm$^3$).

Absolute densities of tungsten alloys were calculated using the Archimedes’ principle, and relative densities were determined using the apparent volume mass divided by the theoretical value of 18.82 g/cm$^3$ [42]. Vickers hardness tests were
conducted under a load of 200 g with a dwelling time of 20 s. Ten different fields were randomly selected, and the mean value was obtained. Cylindrical specimens with size of Φ6 mm ×10 mm were prepared by machining the sintered alloys for compression tests. The ends of the samples were ground and polished flat by Al₂O₃ paper of approximately 1500 meshes. Compression tests were carried out at room temperature using a universal material machine (AG-I250KN) with 1.0 mm/min speed of compression. Hot compression tests were conducted on a Gleeble-1500D testing machine at 1000 °C with a strain rate of 1.0 s⁻¹.

The morphology, microstructure and phase composition of powders and alloys were studied by scanning electron microscope (SEM, VEGA-SBH), back scatter electron image (BSE, VEGA-SBH) and energy-dispersive spectrometer (EDS), respectively. X-ray diffraction (XRD, Brux D8 type) was carried out to characterize the phase’s compositions. Transmission electron microscopy (TEM) and electron diffraction pattern (SAEDP) were employed to observe the microstructure and crystal structure of the doping phase.

3. Results and analysis

3.1 Analysis of precursor powders synthesized through the three L–L methods

As shown in Fig. 3a, the precursor powder prepared through HM exhibits a spherical structure and an average particle size of 3 µm. Based on the XRD pattern of the powder as shown in Fig 3b, all of the diffraction peaks agree well with the standard data file (PDF#15-0217, a=b=0.7388 nm, c=0.7551 nm). Thus, these powders can be indexed to hexagonal (NH₄)₀.₃₃WO₃•H₂O.
Fig. 3c shows that the synthesized powders through SM are mainly composed of large particles with size of 30-60 µm. Most particles have an angular shape and some of them are incomplete. The magnified image in Fig. 3d reveals numerous small particles around or attached to large particles. The EDX analysis reveals that fine particles contain Zr-rich phase. The corresponding positions and intensity values of the diffraction peaks illustrated in Fig. 3b are in good agreement with the XRD pattern of the standard (NH₄)₁₀H₂W₁₂O₄₂·4H₂O (APT·4H₂O) (PDF#49-1642) [43-45]. The APT·4H₂O powders are usually synthesized through wet chemical method, so the complicated peaks exist in XRD patterns [43, 45]. This finding indicates that the synthesized powder consists of APT·4H₂O, which can be confirmed by their square structure. The synthesized APT·4H₂O powders possess the same structure [45]. In other words, APT·4H₂O can be prepared by adding NH₃·H₂O to the AMT solution because of the reversible reaction (Eq. 3) between AMT and APT. This is in good agreement with the presence of (HW₆O₂₁)⁵⁻ ions as listed in Table 2 [39]. The main characteristic parameters of the three precursor powders obtained with different powder processing technology are summarized in Table 3.

\[
(NH_4)_6(H_2W_{12}O_{40})\cdot xH_2O + 4NH_3\cdot H_2O = (NH_4)_{10}(H_2W_{12}O_{42})\cdot yH_2O
\]  

(3)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>pH value</th>
<th>Reversible reaction equation</th>
<th>Reaction products</th>
<th>Common name</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>pH ≤ 1</td>
<td>((H_2W_{12}O_{40})^6^-+6H^+ + 32H_2O = 12(H_2WO_4\cdot 2H_2O))</td>
<td>H₂WO₄·2H₂O</td>
<td>Tungstic acid</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
\[
\text{pH} = 2 \quad H_2W_{12}O_{40}^{6-} + H^+ = HW_{12}O_{19}^{5-} + H_2O
\]
\[
\text{pH} = 4 \quad HW_{12}O_{19}^{5-} + 2H_2O + OH^- = 2(HW_6O_{21})^{3-}
\]
\[\text{pH} = 5 \quad (H_W_6O_{21})^{3-} + 2H^+ = (H_W_6O_{21})^{5-} + 2H_2O
\]
\[\text{pH} > 6 \quad (H_W_6O_{21})^{5-} + 2OH^- = (H_W_6O_{21})^{3-} + 2H_2O + 2H^+ + 7OH^- = 2WO_4^{2-}
\]
\[\text{pH} > 9 \quad 2H^+ + 7OH^- = 2WO_4^{2-}
\]

For the precursor powder prepared through ZM, when only alcohol was used as azeotrope dispersant, the powder particles possess a gravel-like structure and a mean particle size of 50 µm (Fig. 3e). The profile of individual particle is clearly visible. When the mixture of alcohol and n-butyl alcohol was used as azeotrope dispersant, the gravel-like structure changed into the flake structure (Fig. 3f). The morphological transition of precursor powders can be attributed to the physical properties of the raw material (AMT) and the effect of azeotrope dispersant on particle dispersion. Fig. 3b shows the corresponding XRD patterns of the precursor powders through ZM. Seen from these peaks, most diffraction peaks match well with those of commercial AMT powder. However, some other complicated diffraction peaks are also observed in the pattern because AMT is partially decomposed to produce intermediates, such as \(W_xO_y\), \(NH_4NO_3\) and \(Zr(WO_4)_2\), during water evaporation (Eq. 4) [46]. These insoluble substances, providing numerous primary nucleation sites, remain suspended in the solution under high stirring. As water evaporates, the newly generated AMT...
crystallite is induced to nucleate heterogeneously to grow into flake structure (inset of Fig. 3e). The flake precursor powders with high surface areas were used to prepare the following powders and alloys.

\[
(NH_4)_6H_2W_{12}O_{40} \cdot xH_2O + 2Zr(NO_3)_4 = 6NH_3 \uparrow + 8HNO_3 \uparrow + WO_3 \cdot mH_2O \downarrow + 2Zr(WO_4)_2 \cdot nH_2O \downarrow
\]  

\( (NH_4)_{0.33}WO_3 \cdot H_2O \)
Fig. 3 Morphologies and phase compositions of precursors synthesized through different L-L doping processes: (a) HM; (b) XRD patterns of three precursor powders; (c, d) SM; (e) ZM with alcohol used as azeotrope dispersant; (f) ZM with alcohol and n-butyl alcohol used as azeotrope dispersants.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Powder processing technology</th>
<th>Crystallite sizes(Å)</th>
<th>FWHM</th>
<th>a (Å)</th>
<th>b (Å)</th>
<th>c (Å)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HM</td>
<td>231</td>
<td>0.154</td>
<td>7.600</td>
<td>7.600</td>
<td>7.600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM</td>
<td>1264</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>14.944</td>
<td>14.944</td>
<td>14.944</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZM</td>
<td>451</td>
<td>0.181</td>
<td>18.080</td>
<td>18.080</td>
<td>18.080</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3.2 Analysis of reduced doped powders

Fig. 4 shows the SEM micrographs of the three doped tungsten powders with 1.0%ZrO2(Y) reduced at 900 °C for 2 h. The tungsten powder particles prepared by three L–L methods were coated by cloudy containing-(Zr,Y) oxide phase by the analysis of element composition. However, the three powders have obvious differences in morphology and particle size.

Fig. 4 a shows that the HM-powder consists of multifaceted particles with a mean size of 3.75 μm (Table 4). The powder particles have a clear profile, indicating the lower degree of agglomerates compared to other two powders. This may be attributed to the dispersedly microspherical microstructure in HM- precursor powder.
Moreover, the HM-powder has the lowest span value $\psi$ (Table 4), indicating the narrowest particle size distribution (Fig. 4d) [12].

As shown in Fig. 4b, the SM-powder exhibits larger mean particle size and span value with lower internal stress than the HM- and ZM-powders (Table 4). The SM-powder exhibits the widest particle size distribution. Fig. 4b shows that some spongy particles are embedded into the aggregates. The EDS analysis (Fig. 4e) of selected area A reveals that the spongy particles consist of Zr, Y, O and W, which confirms the presence of zirconium and yttrium oxide phases. The formation of spongy particles may be explained as follows. The pH value increases to 7 by adding ammonia solution into the original solution, the formed ZrY(OH)$_x$ sols are full of $-\text{OH}$ groups, which form extensive hydrogen bonds between neighbouring containing-(Zr, Y) particles. When these $-\text{OH}$ groups are eliminated during drying or calcinations/reduction, containing-(Zr, Y) particle agglomerates are formed through strong intercrystallite bonding between neighbouring particles during the removal of the surface hydroxyl groups. The particles are consolidated in the calcination and reduction steps by the following reactions [Eqs. (5, 6)] [47, 48]:

\[
\text{Zr-OH + HO-Zr} = \text{Zr-O-Z} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (5)
\]

\[
\text{Y-OH + HO-Y} = \text{Y-O-Y} + \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (6)
\]

The ZM-doped tungsten powder has smaller particle size than the two other powders (Fig. 4c), as also confirmed by the lowest mean particle size and $d_{\text{bet}}$ size of 1.45 $\mu$m and 1.15 $\mu$m, respectively. Although the ZM-powder obtains the medium span value, most particles have a size of 0.3 $\mu$m to 3.5 $\mu$m. Hence, ZM can be used to
prepare smaller doped tungsten powder particle than the two other methods. This is because that the loose and flaky morphology of the ZM-precursor powder helps the strong penetration of reducing hydrogen and the escape of the reduction products [such as H₂O, WO₂(OH)₂]. As a result, fine and homogeneous ZM-doped powder particles can be obtained through high-temperature reduction. The small size of doped tungsten powder particle is not only favourable for producing small tungsten grains but also for improving the distribution homogeneity of the doped phase [29, 49]. This finding is in agreement with the analysis of the alloy’s microstructure in Fig. 5.

![Image](a)

![Image](b)

![Image](c)

![Image](d)
Fig. 4 SEM images of different doped powders reduced at 900 °C for 2 h: (a) HM-doped powder; (b) SM- doped powder; (c) ZM- doped powder and (d) particle size distribution of three doped powders; (e) EDS spectrum corresponding to the selected area A in Fig. 4 b.

Table 4 Characteristic parameters of the three kinds of powders.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Powders</th>
<th>Mean particle size (μm)</th>
<th>Oxygen (ppm)</th>
<th>SSA (m²/g)</th>
<th>d_BET (μm)</th>
<th>Span value</th>
<th>Internal stress (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HM- powder</td>
<td>3.75</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>0.168</td>
<td>1.85</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM- powder</td>
<td>6.21</td>
<td>378</td>
<td>0.231</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td>0.04</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZM- powder</td>
<td>1.45</td>
<td>660</td>
<td>0.271</td>
<td>1.15</td>
<td>0.76</td>
<td>0.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4. Microstructure and properties of alloys

Fig. 5 shows the SEM and BSE images of the compressive fracture surfaces of alloys obtained from the three doped powders. Alloys prepared through HM, SM and
ZM were denoted as HM-alloy, SM-alloy and ZM-alloy, respectively. The grains of HM-alloy have an average size of 3.6 µm and possess the morphology of the HM-doped tungsten powder particle. The metallurgical point contacts were formed after sintering, leading to the lower density of the HM-alloy compared with the two other alloys (Table 5). This finding may be due to the low density of the green compact owing to the large powder particle size and the large diffusion distance of W atoms during sintering. Moreover, the BSE image (Fig. 5b) shows that most ZrO$_2$(Y) particles in HM-alloy have a spherical shape and an uniform size. The average size of ZrO$_2$(Y) particles is 1.5 µm, having the medium particle size compared with the ZrO$_2$(Y) particle size in two other alloys (Table 5).

As shown in Fig. 5 (c and e), the grain boundaries of SM- and ZM-alloys have formed metallurgical face-contacts and are more compacter than those of HM-alloy. As shown in Fig. 5c, numerous dense grain areas were observed because of the presence of numerous particle aggregates in the SM-doped powder. The large particles in the aggregates easily merge with the small particles, leading to the sharp growth of grains and formation of dense grain areas [50]. However, some deep holes can be observed on the fracture surface, causing a dramatic decrease in the density of SM-alloy. Fig. 5d shows that some adhesive ZrO$_2$(Y) particles (as marked by white circles) exist on fracture surface. The average size of ZrO$_2$(Y) particles in SM-alloy is approximately 2.1 µm, which is the largest over the two other alloys. The SEM and BSE images of ZM-alloy show its excellent microstructure [Figs. 5(e, f)]. The microstructure shows that uniform distribution of fine ZrO$_2$(Y) particles with size of
0.5-2.0 µm and a highly compact microstructure without obvious pores on the fracture surface. Table 5 shows that ZM-alloy has the highest relative density, smallest tungsten grain and smallest ZrO₂(Y) particle size than the two other alloys. Given that these three alloys were pressed and sintered through the same process, the excellent microstructure could be due to the high quality of doped tungsten powder. Hence, ZM is more suitable for obtaining high-quality doped tungsten powder than HM and SM.
Fig. 5 SEM and BSE images of fracture surfaces of three alloys compressive-tested at room temperature: (a) SEM and (b) BSE images of the HM-alloy; (c) SEM and (d) BSE images of the SM-alloy; (e) SEM and (f) BSE images of the ZM-alloy.
Table 5 Microstructure and mechanical properties of three alloys.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloys</th>
<th>Grain /oxide particle size (μm)</th>
<th>Density (g/cm³)</th>
<th>Microhardness /Hv</th>
<th>Compressive strength (MPa) /critical failure strain</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HM -alloy</td>
<td>3.6/1.5</td>
<td>15.88 /84.37</td>
<td>223</td>
<td>1050/0.18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SM -alloy</td>
<td>3.2/2.1</td>
<td>15.53 /82.5</td>
<td>295</td>
<td>998/0.10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ZM -alloy</td>
<td>2.6/1.3</td>
<td>16.48 /87.6</td>
<td>463</td>
<td>1410/0.13</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a* Relative density

TEM and SAEDP observations were carried out to investigate the crystal structure of ZrO₂(Y) in the three alloys (Fig. 6). As shown in Figs. 6 (a, c, d), the particle sizes of ZrO₂(Y) in the HM- and ZM-alloys are in the range from 30 nm to 120 nm, and the corresponding SAEDP results reveal the zirconia phase of c-ZrO₂(Y) (Fm-3m) with face-centred cubic close structure along the zone axis of [-112] and [011]. The SAEDP result of SM-alloy confirms that the ZrO₂(Y) phase is the tetragonal crystal structure along the zone axis of [010]. Moreover, the TEM micrograph shows that large ZrO₂(Y) particles with size ranging from 200 nm to 600 nm tend to aggregate, which is consistent with the SEM observation in Fig. 5d. The above analysis indicates that the crystal structure of ZrO₂ can also be stabilised among three alloys after high temperature sintering.
Fig. 6 TEM image and SAED pattern of the three W-ZrO$_2$(Y) alloys: (a) the HM-alloy; (b) the SM-alloy and (c, d) the ZM-alloy.

The crystal structure of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles in alloys would result from the Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles in doped powders prepared through different L-L doping processes. The XRD patterns of three doped tungsten powders with 5.0 wt. %ZrO$_2$ (Y) were obtained after reduction at 900°C for 2h (Fig. 7). Detailed examination reveals a weak peak at 30°, followed by three diffraction peaks at 2θ=35°, 50° and 59°, respectively. Meanwhile, no obvious peaks were found on both sides of the peak at 30°. Therefore, it can be concluded that Y$_2$O$_3$-stabilised ZrO$_2$ phases can be obtained in doped tungsten powders through the three L–L doping methods combined with calcination–continuous reduction.
Clustered ZrO$_2$ and Y$_2$O$_3$ is the premise of forming stabilised ZrO$_2$ phase [36]. The formation of stabilised ZrO$_2$ may be related to the L–L doping technique described in the Experimental section. Thus, it is easy to understand that the doping processes for synthesizing HM- and SM-precursor powders was used to obtain containing-(Zr, Y) phase close together. In ZM system, upon hydrolysis of ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O, Cl$^-$ ions in the outer sphere of the ionic complex are replaced by OH$^-$ groups (Eq. 7), and [Zr$_4$(OH)$_8$·16H$_2$O]$^{8+}$ can react with hydroxyl ions to form fine Zr(OH)$_4$ sols [51, 52]. Meanwhile, the Y$^{3+}$ ions react with hydroxyl ions to form fine Y(OH)$_3$ sols, as confirmed by the acidity of Y(NO$_3$)$_3$·6H$_2$O solution (pH of 3, similar to that of the AMT solution). Thus, the ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O solution should be firstly mixed with the Y(NO$_3$)$_3$·6H$_2$O solution to obtain composite colloids with Zr(OH)$_4$ close to Y(OH)$_3$.

$$\{[Zr_4(OH)_8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+}+8Cl^-\} + 4H_2O = \{[Zr_4(OH)_8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+}+8OH^-\} + 8HCl↑ \quad (7)$$

Fig. 7 XRD patterns of three composite powders with 5.0%ZrO$_2$(Y) reduced at 900 °C for 2 h.

Mechanical properties are highly determined by the microstructure of materials.
Based on the analysis of the microstructure, ZM-alloy exhibits excellent mechanical properties over the two other alloys. As listed in Table 5, ZM-alloy exhibits the highest density and microhardness of 16.48 g/cm$^3$ and 463 Hv, respectively. The value of compressive strength and critical failure strain are shown in Table 5 and Fig. 8. The values of the compressive strength of ZM-alloy at room and high temperatures reach to 1410 MPa and 296 MPa, 33.3% and 31.5% higher than those of HM-alloy, respectively. At room temperature, although the density of SM-alloy is lower than that of HM-alloy, the microhardness and high temperature compressive strength of the former are 32.2% and 17.8% higher than those of the latter. The compressive strength of SM-alloy at room temperature is similar to that of HM-alloy. Instead, the SM-alloy has higher compressive strength tested at 1000 °C. At room temperature, the critical failure strain of HM-alloy reaches to 0.18. It shows the highest critical failure strain, and is appropriately 27.8% higher than that of ZM-alloy. However, at high temperature, ZM-alloy exhibits highest critical failure strain, this may be attributed to the highest density compared to other two alloy.

Fig. 8 Dynamic engineering stress-strain curves in the compressive testing (with imposed strain rate of 1.0 s$^{-1}$): (a) at room temperature and (b) at 1000 °C.
4. Discussion

The physical characteristics of the precursor powder greatly affect the resultant reduced powders and further affect the microstructure and properties of alloy. It is necessary to study the influence of different liquid-liquid doping processes on the oxide distribution and precursor morphology.

In the experiment of preparing the SM-precursor powders, in order to obtaining containing-(Zr, Y) sols with good fluidity and uniform distribution, firstly, the original solution was prepared of ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O, YCl$_3$·6H$_2$O and (NH$_4$)$_6$H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$·xH$_2$O, and then the proper amount of ammonia was added into the original solution at room temperature. During raising the pH value of original solution to 6, as these reaction (3) between the (NH$_4$)$_6$H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$·xH$_2$O and NH$_3$·H$_2$O occur slowly at room temperature, so the reactions between Zr$^{4+}$ and Y$^{3+}$ with OH$^-$ firstly occur, respectively, and then produce loose composite sol zirconium-yttrium hydroxide [ZrY(OH)$_x$] in solution. Due to the addition of surface dispersant PEG, these fine composite soles were suspended in solution under high stirring. However, high concentrations of (HW$_{12}$O$_{395}^-$) ions would penetrate into the gap between composite sols. Because of the increase of SM system’ temperature, the reaction between (HW$_{12}$O$_{395}^-$) ions and OH$^-$ occurs quickly and forms APT·4H$_2$O sols. These APT sols would be surrounded by ZrY(OH)$_x$ sols as shown in Fig. 9a. Meanwhile, due to the high absorptivity resulted from larger surface area of APT·4H$_2$O sols, the numerous neighbouring APT·4H$_2$O sols aggregate together as shown in Fig. 9b, which results in the entrapment of ZrY(OH)$_x$ sols among APT·4H$_2$O sols.
Fig. 9 TEM (a, b) images of precursor powders synthesized by sol-gel method.

For HM precursor, it is easy to observe that the microspheres consist of nanoplates as shown in Fig. 10a. TEM image shows that a lattice fringe was observed with a lattice spacing of 0.384 nm and identified as the (002) plane of hexagonal-phase \((\text{NH}_4)_{0.33}\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{H}_2\text{O}\), indicating the growth of nanoplates along the c-axis direction [53]. The \(\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{nH}_2\text{O}\) from the crystal cell is firstly formed by the hydrothermal reaction (Eq. 8) as shown in Fig. 10b. In this structure of \(\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{nH}_2\text{O}\), each oxygen atom is shared by two octahedrons, forming six-membered rings with numerous hexagonal and trigonal tunnels (Fig. 10c) [54-56]. These rings usually stack by sharing axial oxygen in the c axis [001] and form hexagonal prisms (Fig. 10d). In hydrothermal system, the high concentration of \(\text{NH}_4^+\) ions would occupy the hexagonal tunnels (Fig. 10c) [57, 58] and then accelerate the growth of hexagonal-prism \(\text{WO}_3\) along the [001] direction and then form the hierarchical \((\text{NH}_4)_{0.33}\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{H}_2\text{O}\) nanoplates. Finally, these nanoplates self-assemble together to form microspheres in order to reduce the high surface energy [59].

\[
(\text{NH}_4)_{6}\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}\cdot\text{xH}_2\text{O} + 6\text{HNO}_3 = 6\text{NH}_4\text{NO}_3 + 12\text{WO}_3\cdot\text{nH}_2\text{O} \downarrow + (8-x) \text{H}_2\text{O} \quad (8)
\]
Hard agglomerate formation is a consequence of the interaction of free water molecules with the free hydroxyls on the surface of the colloid particles through hydrogen bonds as shown in Fig. 11a. The physically absorbed water molecule will act as liquid bridges, which draw neighbouring particles together. As water is removed through drying, the hydrogen bonds between the hydroxyls on the surface of two neighbouring particles will draw them closer. In particular, calcination will cause the formation of strong chemical bonds and solid bridges between neighbouring particles, thereby increasing the degree of hard agglomerates.

As alcohol and water are mutually soluble, it is conductive to turn the wet gel into powders through removal of water in the wet colloid. However, the high evaporation rate of azeotropic substances (water and alcohol) decreases the dispersion effect of alcohol on wet colloids due to the lower azeotropic point (approximately 78.5 °C) of the water–alcohol system than the water bath temperature (93 °C), resulting in the formation of coarse gravel-likes particles (Fig. 3e).

In this study, the mixture of alcohol and butanol was used as azeotropic agent to
increase the azeotropic point of the azeotropic substances (water, alcohol and butanol) and contribute to the formation of the flaky precursor powder (Fig. 3f). As the azeotropic substance vapours slowly and butanol dissolved easily in alcohol, once precipitates exist in the solution, butanol would cover precipitate with organic film, which would further form the organic molecular chains in the subsequent drying process. As a result, the hydroxyl groups on the particle surface will be replaced by organic molecular chains (–OC₄H₉ group), hindering the particles to close together (Fig. 11b) [60]. In the following solvent removal process, there is little possibility of the formation of chemical bonds between neighbouring particles, obviating the possibility of the formation of the hard agglomerates. Meanwhile, the butoxy group has space blocking function that would prevent the approaching of particles [61]. Thus, flaky structure of AMT powder can be obtained.
Fig. 11 (a) The role of organic molecular chains with respect to the dehydration process of gravel-like doped AMT to flaky doped AMT; (b) Schematic flowchart of preventing from agglomerating during azeotropic distillation dehydration.

5. Conclusions

Three precursor powders such as doped h-(\(\text{NH}_4\))\(_{0.33}\)WO\(_3\)·H\(_2\)O, doped APT and doped AMT powders were synthesised through HM, SM and ZM, respectively. The different physical characteristics of W-ZrO\(_2\)(Y) powders were obtained through calcination–continuous reduction.

HM and ZM can be used to synthesise extremely homogeneous microspherical and flaky precursor powders, respectively. The doped precursor powder prepared through SM is mainly composed of large square particles. The synthesis mechanisms of the three doped precursor powders were investigated. The doped powder through ZM was determined to have low reduction efficiency because of highly disperse and fine oxide particle among powders, leading to the smallest average particle size of the doped tungsten powders compared with those of the doped powders prepared through HM and SM. Moreover, the synthesis mechanisms of Y\(_2\)O\(_3\)-stabilised ZrO\(_2\) in the three doped powders were discussed.

The microstructures and mechanical properties of alloys obtained from three doped tungsten powders were analysed to confirm the excellent physical properties of doped powder obtained through ZM. The alloy prepared through ZM exhibits the smallest size of tungsten grains and ZrO\(_2\)(Y) particles, highest sintering densification and highest microhardness and dynamic compressive strength than the alloys prepared
through HM and SM. Hence, ZM is an appropriate method for preparing high-quality ZrO$_2$(Y) doped tungsten powders.

**Conflicts of interest**

There are no conflicts to declare.

**Founding:** This work is supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China [No. 51672070; No. 51874185], Henan province science and technology innovation talent plan, China [No. 2017JQ0012] and Graduate Research and Innovation Projects in Jiangsu Province [No. KYCX19_0182]. This work also has been supported by the EIPHI Graduate School (contract ANR-17-EURE-0002).

**Acknowledgements**

We would like to thank all the researchers who participated in our works discussed in the paper and whose names appear in references.

**Reference**


[17] X. Fu, D. Huck, L. Makein, B. Armstrong, U. Willen, T. Freeman, Effect of


