Extremely uniform nanosized oxide particles dispersion strengthened tungsten alloy with high tensile and compressive strengths fabricated involving liquid-liquid method

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Manuscript Number:</th>
<th>JALCOM-D-20-14911R2</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Article Type:</td>
<td>Full Length Article</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Keywords:</td>
<td>Tungsten heavy alloys; oxide particle strengthening; Zirconia; liquid-liquid doping; compressive strength; Hot isostatic pressing</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| Corresponding Author: | fangnao xiao  
Univ. Bourgogne Franche-Comté, FEMTO-ST Institute  
Besançon, FRANCE |
| First Author:      | fangnao xiao |
| Order of Authors:  | fangnao xiao  
Thierry Barriere  
Gang Cheng  
Qiang Miao  
Shiwei Zuo  
Shizhong Wei  
Liujie Xu |
| Abstract:          | In this study, tungsten heavy alloys reinforced with highly uniform and dispersed nanosized Zr(Y)O2 particles were investigated. These alloys exhibited a high compressive strength and enhanced plasticity. To fabricate these alloys, we used a novel process involving molecular level liquid-liquid doping combined with hot isostatic pressing. The Zr(Y)O2 particles thus produced were smaller than 200 nm in size and bonded well with tungsten grains. The size of Zr(Y)O2 particles and tungsten grains are much smaller than those of the state-of-the-art review and the details of the grain refinement mechanisms were discussed. The effect of Zr(Y)O2 particles and strain rate on the compressive properties of the alloys was investigated in detail and the corresponding compressive deformation mechanisms were elucidated. The highest ultimate tensile and compressive strengths of the fabricated alloys at room temperature (27°C) were 906 and 1445 MPa, respectively, which are higher than most of reported values in the literature. The ultimate tensile strength and fracture strain of WHAs decrease with the mass fraction of Zr(Y)O2 (from 0 to 0.75%). The alloys exhibit the brittle material behaviour in tension, compared to the pure tungsten with ductile material behaviour. The tensile fracture surface consists of W - W cleavage patterns and ductile failure of the matrix. The results obtained in this research will act as basic guidelines for the fabrication of ODS-W alloys by liquid-liquid doping process. |
| Order of Authors (with Contributor Roles): | fangnao xiao  
Thierry Barriere  
Gang Cheng  
Qiang Miao  
Shiwei Zuo  
Shizhong Wei  
Liujie Xu |
Apr. 27, 2021

To

Prof. Ludwig Schultz

Editor: Journal of Alloys and Compounds

Cover letter

Dear Sir,

I am pleased to submit the revised version of our research article entitled “Extremely uniform nanosized oxide particles dispersion strengthened tungsten alloy with high tensile and compressive strengths fabricated involving liquid-liquid method” for publication in Journal of Alloys and Compounds. The reviewers’ comments are addressed in the present draft and the responses to these comments are appended herewith for your reference.

We believe that the improved version of the manuscript is now appropriate for publication.

This manuscript has not been published nor under consideration for publication elsewhere. We have no conflicts of interest to disclose.

Thank you for your consideration.
Response to Editor and Reviewer Comments:

No.: JALCOM-D-20-14911R1

Title: Extremely uniform nanosized oxide particles dispersion strengthened tungsten alloy with high tensile and compressive strengths fabricated involving liquid-liquid method

We sincerely thank you and the reviewer for your insightful comments; they have proven very useful in enhancing the quality of our manuscript. We have addressed the issue indicated in the review reports. The changes made to the manuscript are highlighted in red.

Reviewer #2: The authors have tried to address all questions raised by the two reviewers in their response, and the manuscript has been improved. My comments have been addressed mostly, but I still think it is necessary for the authors to present the tensile engineering stress-strain curves. We do not know how the authors obtain the ultimate tensile strength of the alloys in Fig. 11a. And I think the authors' reason that "the paper is already too long" is insufficient. Furthermore, if the ductility is not mentioned, the significance of the article is questionable.

Response: Thank you for your suggestions. The tensile engineering stress-strain curves of the WHA alloys with different mass fraction of Zr(Y)O₂ were added in revised paper (Fig. 11a). The UTS of the associated alloy and pure tungsten were modified and compared with the state of art.
The mechanical behaviour in tension (ductile and brittle) of the materials was discussed in the manuscript. The mechanical behaviour for different alloys under various solicitations was underlined in abstract and conclusion.
Extremely uniform nanosized oxide particles dispersion strengthened tungsten alloy with high tensile and compressive strengths fabricated involving liquid-liquid method

Fangnao Xiao a*, Thierry Barriere a, Gang Cheng b, Qiang Miao c, Shiwei Zuo c

a Université Bourgogne Franche-Comté, FEMTO-ST Institute, CNRS/UFC/ENSMM/UTBM, Department of Applied Mechanics, 25000 Besançon, France
b INSA CVL, Université Tours, Université Orléans, LaMé, 3 rue de la Chocolaterie, CS 23410, 41034 Blois Cedex, France
c College of Material Science and Technology, Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics, 29 Yudao Street, Nanjing 210000, China

*Corresponding author

E-mail: fangnao.xiao@femto-st.fr

Full postal address:
FEMTO-ST Institute, Department of Applied Mechanics, 24 chemin de l’épitaphe, 25000, Besançon, France
Tel.: +33381666000
Abstract

In this study, tungsten heavy alloys reinforced with highly uniform and dispersed nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were investigated. These alloys exhibited a high compressive strength and enhanced plasticity. To fabricate these alloys, we used a novel process involving molecular level liquid-liquid doping combined with hot isostatic pressing. The Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles thus produced were smaller than 200 nm in size and bonded well with tungsten grains. The size of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles and tungsten grains are much smaller than those of the state-of-the-art review and the details of the grain refinement mechanisms were discussed. The highest ultimate tensile and compressive strengths of the fabricated alloys at room temperature (27°C) were 895 and 1445 MPa, respectively, which are much higher than the values reported in the literature. The tensile fracture surface consists of W - W cleavage patterns and ductile failure of the matrix. The effect of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles and strain rate on the compressive properties of the alloys was investigated in detail and the corresponding compressive deformation mechanisms were elucidated.

Keywords: Tungsten heavy alloys; oxide particle strengthening; zirconia; liquid-liquid doping; compressive strength; hot isostatic pressing

Nomenclature

- $\alpha$-HATB: Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze $(\text{NH}_4)_0.33\cdot\text{WO}_3$
- $\beta$-HATB: Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze $(\text{NH}_4)_0.42\cdot\text{WO}_3$
- AMT: Ammonium metatungstate
- APT: Ammonium paratungstate
- DUAs: Depleted uranium alloys
- EDS: Energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy
- HATB: Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze, $(\text{NH}_4)_x\cdot\text{WO}_3$
- HIP: Hot isostatic pressing
- HR-TEM: High-resolution transmission electron microscopy
- HV: Vickers hardness
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L-L</td>
<td>Liquid-liquid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L-S</td>
<td>Liquid-solid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA</td>
<td>Mechanical alloying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODS-W</td>
<td>Oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODS-WHAs</td>
<td>Oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten heavy alloys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSZ</td>
<td>Partially stabilised zirconia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RD</td>
<td>Relative densities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAED</td>
<td>Selected area electron diffraction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>Scanning electron microscopy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>Spark plasma sintering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S-S</td>
<td>Solid-solid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTS</td>
<td>Ultimate tensile strength</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VD</td>
<td>Sintering process in the vertical direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAs</td>
<td>Tungsten heavy alloys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA-Zr(Y)O₂</td>
<td>Zr(Y)O₂ particle dispersion-strengthened 93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-M</td>
<td>Tungsten-matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-W</td>
<td>Tungsten-tungsten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XRD</td>
<td>X-ray diffraction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Introduction

Tungsten heavy alloys (WHAs) are promising materials for kinetic energy penetrators, radiation shields, and rocket nozzles, owing to their moderate ductility, high density, and quasi-static strength [1-4]. In particular, WHAs are more suitable for use in kinetic energy penetrators than depleted uranium alloys (DUAs) as they pose no risk of radioactive contamination [5]. Furthermore, they exhibit a lower penetration performance (by ~20%) than DUAs at high strain rates [6,7].

Generally, the penetration capability of WHAs depends on their strength and toughness [8]. The existing WHAs obtained using conventional powder metallurgy are limited to anti-armour penetrators owing to the weak mechanical properties of coarse tungsten grains [9]. In recent years, a large number of researchers have focused on improving the mechanical performance of WHA penetrators by inducing microstructural changes [10-12] via changing the WHA composition by adding alloying elements or rare earth oxides (Y$_2$O$_3$, La$_2$O$_3$, ZrO$_2$, ThO$_2$, and CeO$_2$) [13-16] or by microstructural refinement [17-20].

Grain refinement in tungsten is known to significantly enhance its mechanical properties. However, the grain size of WHAs depends partially on the particle size of the initial powders. In the past few years, liquid-liquid (L-L) doping techniques have been developed for oxide particle-doped tungsten powders. Xu et al. fabricated La$_2$O$_3$-doped ultra-fine tungsten powders using Na$_2$WO$_4\cdot$2H$_2$O and La(NO$_3$)$_3\cdot$6H$_2$O as the raw materials [21]. Nanosized La$_2$O$_3$-doped tungsten powders with a particle size of ~700 nm were realised by hydrogen reduction. Dong et al. synthesised Y$_2$O$_3$-doped nanosized tungsten powders with an average particle size of 40–50 nm via a wet-chemical process [22]. Xiao et al. used the hydrothermal method coupled with hydrogen reduction to develop nanocrystal powders of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ with an average particle size of 30 nm [23]; these oxides were used as nucleation cores in tungsten for particle refinement. Rare earth elements (such as Y, Zr and La) decrease the number of O and P impurities aggregating at the interface and thus improve the performance of WHA penetrators [24]. In addition, nanosized oxide particles can lead to dispersion strengthening and grain refinement, thus increasing the strength and
ductility of the alloys fabricated by L-L doping [25,26]. Therefore, L-L doping with nanosized oxide particles is considered to be an effective approach for improving the mechanical performance of WHAs.

In this study, a novel material based on dispersion-strengthened 93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloys [WHA-Zr(Y)O₂] using nanosized Zr(Y)O₂ is proposed. WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ was prepared by a hydrothermal method combined with mechanical alloying. Nanosized Zr(Y)O₂ dispersion-strengthened WHAs were fabricated by conventional solid-phase sintering and hot isostatic pressing (HIP). The uniaxial tensile and compressive properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ were estimated and the effect of Zr(Y)O₂ on the microstructure and mechanical properties of the WHAs were investigated. These microstructural characteristics and mechanical properties of the present WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ alloys were compared with those of the state-of-the-art WHA materials to demonstrate the effectiveness of the proposed method. It indicates that the fabricated alloys exhibit more smaller size of tungsten grains and oxide particles, and higher ultimate tensile and compressive strengths.

This article is structured as follows. In Section 2, the sample preparation and characterisation processes are described in detail. In Section 3, our observations on powder morphology, WHA microstructure, and the mechanical properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ alloys are described with reference to the relevant literature. Finally, our major conclusions are presented in Section 4.

2. Experimental procedure

2.1 Sample preparation

In the present work, four W-Zr(Y)O₂ powders were prepared using the process shown in Fig. 1. The composition of the alloy powders contained varying amounts of Zr(Y)O₂ (0, 0.25, 0.5, and 0.75 wt.% denoted as WHA₀, WHA 0.25, WHA 0.50 and WHA 0.75, respectively, as listed in Table 1). The commercial raw materials included zirconium oxychloride octahydrate (ZrOCl₂·8H₂O; grade AR), yttrium nitrate [Y(NO₃)₃·6H₂O; grade AR] and ammonium metatungstate [(NH₄)₆H₂W₁₂O₄₉·5H₂O; grade AR; AMT]. The supplier of ZrOCl₂·8H₂O and Y(NO₃)₃·6H₂O powders was
Shanghai Diyang Industrial Co., LTD. The AMT powder was provided by Wuhan Kabuda Chemical Co., LTD. The synthesis and reduction of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powders were carried out according to previously described protocols [27]. After hydrothermal treatment, the precursor consisted of hexagonal (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·(α-hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze, α-HATB, PDF# 42-0452), as shown in Fig. 2a). The reduction process included the following stages – a first reduction step at 500 °C for 1.5 h resulting in hexagonal (NH$_4$)$_{0.42}$WO$_3$ (β-HATB, PDF#42-0451), which is expected to produce high-quality doped tungsten powders and alloys [27], and a second reduction reaction at 800 °C for 2 h to yield W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powder.

W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ alloys were fabricated by spark plasma sintering (SPS) at 2000 °C for 5 min at 30 MPa. Mechanical alloying (MA) was conducted to blend elemental Ni, Fe, and W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powders at the appropriate proportions. A planetary ball mill was used at a milling speed of 250 rpm for 6 h. The milling media consisted of 3 mm diameter tungsten carbide balls with ball-to-powder ratio of 10:1. The milled powders were compacted into cylindrical rods by cold isostatic pressing at 250 MPa. Subsequently, the green compacts were sintered at 1250 °C for 1 h in a hydrogen atmosphere. These samples were later sintered by hot isostatic pressing at 1400 °C for 2 h at 180 MPa. Fig. 2b) shows the X-ray diffraction (XRD) pattern of WHA$_{0.75}$, which suggests the presence of W and γ(Fe, Ni) phases.
Fig. 1 Schematic diagram of the synthesis of WHAs

Table 1 Chemical composition of WHA-Zr(Y)O_2 alloys (wt.%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>W</th>
<th>Fe</th>
<th>Ni</th>
<th>ZrO_2</th>
<th>Y_2O_3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WHA_0</td>
<td>93.00</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA_0.25</td>
<td>92.72</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA_0.50</td>
<td>92.44</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA_0.75</td>
<td>92.16</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 2 XRD patterns of a) powder precursor and doped reduced powder and b) WHA_0.75
2.2 Measurement, experimental procedures, and analysis

The microstructure of the fabricated powders and alloys was evaluated by scanning electron microscopy (SEM), energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS), and high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HR-TEM). XRD analysis was conducted on the produced powders and alloys to identify their crystalline phases. The absolute densities of the alloys were determined using Archimedes’ principle and theoretical densities were calculated based on the theoretical mass and volume. Relative density (RD) was calculated as the ratio of absolute and theoretical densities.

Vickers hardness (HV) testing was conducted with a 200 g indenting load and a dwell time of 20 s using the HVS-1000 digital micro Vickers hardness tester. The obtained value represented the average of values sourced from ten random positions on the alloy cross-section. Grain-size data was acquired using a line intercept method and at least 100 identifiable grains were considered for this measurement. Tungsten-tungsten (W-W) contiguity ($C_{WW}$), which is defined as the relative fraction of the W-W interfacial area, was estimated according to Eq. (1) [28],

$$C_{WW} = \frac{2N_{WW}}{(N_{WW} + N_{WM})}$$

where $N_{WW}$ and $N_{WM}$ indicate the number of W-W grain boundaries and tungsten-matrix (W-M) interfaces intercepted by an arbitrary straight line per unit length in the SEM images, respectively.

Tensile properties were measured on a universal testing machine (Instron-5967) at a constant loading rate of 0.3 mm/min at room temperature (27 °C). The average of three measured values is reported as the tensile strength of a given sample; specimen dimension is shown in Fig. 3.

![Fig. 3 Dimension of tensile testing specimens (all units are in mm)](image-url)
The compressive properties of the samples were measured on a universal material machine (Shimadzu AG-I250kN) at strain rates of $10^{-3}$, $10^{-2}$, $10^{-1}$, and 1 s$^{-1}$. Cylindrical samples with a diameter and length of 6 and 10 mm, respectively, were used for this purpose.

3. Results and discussions

3.1 Precursor morphology and Zr(Y)O$_2$ particle size and distribution

The morphology of the precursors synthesised using the hydrothermal method is illustrated in Fig. 4. The precursor consisted of nanoplates, with a diameter of less than 20 nm and length of ~100 nm, as shown in Fig. 4a). The lattice fringe image indicated a spacing of 0.384 nm, corresponding to the (002) plane of hexagonal (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·H$_2$O and this indicates the growth of nanoplates along the $c$ axis [29].

Primary crystals (WO$_3$·nH$_2$O) precipitated from the crystal cell were initially formed by the hydrothermal reaction (Eq. (2)) between (H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$)$^{6-}$ and H$^+$ [20]. Tungsten atoms in WO$_3$·nH$_2$O are bound to six oxygen atoms in a regular octahedral coordination pattern, as shown in Fig. 4d). Each oxygen atom is shared by two octahedrons, which are arranged in layers to form six-membered rings and then form numerous hexagonal and trigonal tunnels by sharing equatorial oxygen in the ab plane (001) [30-32]. These rings are usually stacked by sharing oxygen along the $c$ axis [001] and form hexagonal prisms. At the same time, due to their high concentration, NH$_4^+$ ions in the hydrothermal system occupied the hexagonal tunnels [33,34], thus accelerating the growth of hexagonal-prism-like WO$_3$ in the [001] direction and the formation of hierarchical (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·H$_2$O nanoplates. The presence of NH$_4^+$ and H$^+$ can contribute to the formation of urchin-like h-WO$_3$ microspheres, as shown in Fig. 4b). During the hydrothermal reaction, numerous tiny WO$_3$ crystals nucleate and grow into WO$_3$ nanoplates due to the orientation effect of NH$_4^+$; these crystals self-assemble to form microspheres to reduce surface energy. The high concentration of NH$_4^+$ around WO$_3$ microspheres accelerates the oriented growth of WO$_3$. Thus, numerous nanoplates grow epitaxially from the surface of a microsphere. This may be due to the addition of ions (Zr$^{4+}$, Y$^{3+}$, and Cl$^-$) to the hydrothermal system and
breakage of order between the positive and negative charges destroying the self-assembly process, which leads to the transformation of agglomerated microspheres into relatively disperse cotton-like precursors.

\[(NH_4)_6H_2W_{12}O_{40} \cdot xH_2O + 6HNO_3 = 6NH_4NO_3 + 12WO_3 \cdot nH_2O + (8-x)H_2O \quad (2)\]

Fig. 4 Experimental observations and a schematic of α-HATB synthesis. a) TEM image of the undoped precursor, b) SEM image of the undoped precursor, c) SEM image of the doped precursor containing the (Zr, Y) phase, and d) illustration of morphology evolution in the \((NH_4)_{0.33}WO_3 \cdot H_2O\) precursor.

The size of oxide particles and their distribution in tungsten powders and alloys were studied (Fig. 5). A SEM image of the powder reduced at the optimised processing parameters is shown in Fig 5a). The powder particles exhibited small diameter and excellent dispersion, which is beneficial for increasing the uniformity and density of the microstructure during sintering. Further, nanoscale white particles, composed of Zr(Y)O_2, were scattered on the surfaces of tungsten particles, as shown
SPS was conducted to produce W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ alloys and investigate the effect of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particle size and distribution on the alloy microstructure, as shown in Fig. 5b). Oxide particle size was found to be uneven in the range of 100–500 nm. According to the magnified image of the selected area in Fig. 5b$_1$), a large number of white particles were found to be distributed within the grains, which helped in enhancing material properties. Moreover, a large number of nanoparticles (50 nm) were found to be distributed within the microstructure, as observed by TEM. A strong bonding was thus formed between the particles and tungsten phase even though there was no phase coherence between tungsten and the oxide, as shown in Fig. 5c$_1$).

Fig. 5 Morphology and microstructure of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powders and alloys obtained using the proposed approach. a and a$_1$) SEM images of the morphology of the W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powder. b and b$_1$) SEM images of the microstructure of the W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ alloy. c and c$_1$) TEM and HR-TEM images of the W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ alloy.

The microstructure and mechanical properties of oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten alloys (ODS-W) fabricated in this study were
compared with those reported earlier (alloys with the same or similar composition obtained by different processes as shown in Table 2). Fast sintering techniques, such as HIP, SPS, and sintering in vertical direction (VD), eliminate oxide particle growth. From Table 2, it may be inferred that L-L methods are better at yielding fine oxide particles in ODS-W alloys than L-S and S-S methods [35-37]. However, the size of these particles varied widely at 3.6, 1.5, and 2.5 μm. They were still much coarser than the oxide particles synthesised in tungsten alloys using the approach proposed in the current study. A similar observation could be made for ODS-W alloys fabricated by L-S methods. Yar et al. [40] prepared nanosized W-Y₂O₃ alloy by L-S doping. However, these Y₂O₃ particles were non-uniformly distributed in the tungsten matrix as the reaction occurred at the surfaces of the raw material alone (ammonium paratungstate, APT). Nanosized oxide particles were used as raw materials in S-S doping (mechanical alloying), but a large adsorption effect led to particle aggregation even after 30 h of ball milling [43]. In current research, the oxide particles obtained in tungsten alloys using the current approach were 0.8–10 times smaller when compared to those described in previous reports. This difference indicates that the proposed L-L doping process is appropriate to reduce particle size in tungsten alloys.

Table 2  Comparison of the microstructure and mechanical properties of ODS-W alloys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Doping process</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>Alloy</th>
<th>W grain size (μm)</th>
<th>Oxide particle size (μm)</th>
<th>Density (g/cm³)/Relative density (%)</th>
<th>Microhardness (HV)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L-L</td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-6vol% Al₂O₃</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>&gt;1.0</td>
<td>-94.96</td>
<td>347.39</td>
<td>[35]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-2.5%ZrO₂</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>-99.6</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>[36]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VD</td>
<td>W-2.5%ZrO₂</td>
<td>40-80</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>-98.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[37]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L-S*</td>
<td>VD</td>
<td>W-La₂O₃</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[38]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-0.9wt.%La₂O₃</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>17.8/94</td>
<td>406</td>
<td>[39]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-1.0%Y₂O₃</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Nanosize</td>
<td>17.5/92</td>
<td>423</td>
<td>[40]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3.2 Microstructure of WHAs

The morphology of WHA$_{0.75}$ powder produced by the mechanical alloying of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powder with Ni and Fe powders is shown in Fig. 6a). It can be observed that the structure of the WHA$_{0.75}$ powder is much looser than that of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ (Fig. 5a)). The microstructures of WHAs with different weight ratios of Zr(Y)O$_2$ are shown in Fig. 6(b–d). According to Fig. 6b), spherical tungsten grains are embedded in the matrix phase due to liquid-phase formation during sintering at 1400 °C [44]. It could be confirmed that the grain size of WHA$_{0.75}$ is smaller than that of WHA$_0$ after comparing the average size of 100 grains. W grains in alloys with and without Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were uneven in size; the growth of W grains during liquid-phase sintering may be explained by Ostwald ripening [45]. In the current experimental conditions, smaller particles reprecipitated on larger tungsten grains during their dissolution in the matrix [46]. The uneven growth in tungsten grain size may be attributed to the low sintering temperatures and short durations, which decrease the mobility and effective diffusion of W atoms.

Moreover, grain contiguity reduced slightly as the grain size decreased, similar to previously reported results [47]. The reason for the decrease in W-W contiguity is that Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles induce the liquid phase $\gamma$(Fe$_{0.64}$N$_{0.36}$) to infiltrate W grain boundaries during sintering [48]. Thus, tungsten grains are gradually covered by the $\gamma$(Fe$_{0.64}$N$_{0.36}$) phase to enhance the mechanical properties of oxide particle dispersion-strengthened WHAs (ODS-WHAs).

---

### Table

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>S-S</th>
<th>HIP</th>
<th>W-1%La$_2$O$_3$</th>
<th>-</th>
<th>&gt;5</th>
<th>18.9/90.6</th>
<th>-</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>HIP</td>
<td>W-Ti-0.5%Y$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>2-5</td>
<td>&gt;1.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-5%HfO$_2$</td>
<td>11.6</td>
<td>&gt;5</td>
<td>-94.5</td>
<td>440</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Current process</td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-0.5% Zr(Y)O$_2$</td>
<td>4.67 ± 0.5</td>
<td>0.25 ± 0.05</td>
<td>18.44/96.7 ± 0.2</td>
<td>472 ± 10</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* using APT as the tungsten source.
A magnified image of the area enclosed in red in Fig. 6c) is presented in Fig. 6d) to understand the microstructure of WHA_{0.75} in further detail. A large number of white particles with similar particle size of less than 200 nm could be observed. These Zr(Y)O_2 particles were dispersed in W grains. Generally, large oxide particles induce stress/strain concentration for crack initiation and reduce the fracture toughness of an alloy [49]. Therefore, nanosized Zr(Y)O_2 particles (such as those in the present alloy) obtained by the proposed process are expected to enhance the mechanical properties of WHAs.

Fig. 6 SEM images of the microstructure of a) WHA_{0.75}, b) WHA_0, and c) and d) WHA_{0.75} at 500x and 5000x, respectively

The microstructure of WHA_{0.75} after quasi-static compressive loading at room temperature (27 °C) was characterized by TEM. As shown in Fig. 7a)–c), oxide nanoparticles with prismatic and subspherical structure exhibited different particle sizes. In Fig. 7a), it may be observed that the prismatic particles surrounded by a
black phase were ~200 nm in size. In Fig. 7b) and c), it can be seen that subspherical particles smaller than 50 nm were embedded in shallow phases consisting of Ni, Fe, and W, as described by EDS. White cubic nanocrystalline Zr(Y)O₂ particles were detected in the selected area electron diffraction (SAED) pattern in the inset of Fig. 7a). Dislocation substructures are marked by white arrows in the matrix phase, as shown in Fig. 7c). Meanwhile, Fig. 7d) illustrates a well-bonded interface between the tungsten phase and Zr(Y)O₂ even though there was no coherent relationship.

![Fig. 7 a) and b) TEM images of WHA₀.₇₅, c) TEM image of the matrix phase, and d) HRTEM image of the Zr(Y)O₂/W interface](image)

The microstructures of several heavy tungsten alloys reinforced by ZrO₂ particles are shown in Fig. 8. Daoush et al. [49] fabricated W-Ni-ZrO₂ alloys by conventional sintering at 1500 °C for 1 h. The ZrO₂ particles in these alloys ranged from 0.5 to 3 μm in size, as shown in Fig. 8a), and they were almost at or close to the grain
boundaries. Lee et al. [51] fabricated partially stabilised zirconia (PSZ) dispersion-strengthened WHAs by two-step mechanical alloying to control the location of oxide particles. However, the PSZ particles in the alloys still grew to be as large as 1.5 μm, as shown in Fig. 8b), and some adhesive oxide particles marked by red arrows could be observed. Xu et al. [47] studied Zr(Y)O₂ dispersion-strengthened 92.5W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloys using azeotropic distillation process. In these alloys, the Zr(Y)O₂ particles were 200–1000 nm large, as shown in Fig. 8c). Wang et al. [36] synthesised W-ZrO₂ alloys using a combination of the hydrothermal method and SPS. In this case, agglomerated precursors could be detected and the adhesive ZrO₂ particles grew to 3 μm, as shown in Fig. 8d). In addition, other large oxide particles (La₂O₃, Y₂O₃, and Al₂O₃) were also used to strengthen tungsten alloys (Table 2 and 3). Non-uniformly distributed coarse particles induce uneven stress and strain distribution around these reinforced particles, thus weakening the alloys.
Fig. 8 Microstructures of WHAs reinforced by ZrO\textsubscript{2} particles. a) W-Ni-ZrO\textsubscript{2} [49], b) W-Ni-Fe-PSZ [51], c) W-Ni-Fe-ZrO\textsubscript{2} [47], and d) W-ZrO\textsubscript{2} [36]

Table 3 Microstructure and mechanical properties of ODS-WHA reported in the literature and in the current study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heavy tungsten alloy</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>RD (%)</th>
<th>Grain size ((\mu)m)</th>
<th>Particle size ((\mu)m)</th>
<th>Hardness (HV)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-0.3PSZ</td>
<td>1480 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[49]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-1Al\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3}</td>
<td>1480 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>98.3</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-xY2O3</td>
<td>1850 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>0.6-1.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Co-Y\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3}</td>
<td>1450 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>&gt;0.6</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>[44]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94W-4.56Ni-1.14Fe-Y\textsubscript{2}O\textsubscript{3}</td>
<td>1485 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[53]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Previous W-ODS</td>
<td>SPS/HIP</td>
<td>&lt;99.9</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>1-5</td>
<td>406-480</td>
<td>[27]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{3}</td>
<td>1520 °C (2.5 h)</td>
<td>99.2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0.5-1</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>[47]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA\textsubscript{0.75}</td>
<td>1400 °C (2.5 h)</td>
<td>99.5 ± 0.1</td>
<td>25 ± 2</td>
<td>0.2-1</td>
<td>407 ± 10</td>
<td>Present</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Intracrystalline heavy tungsten alloys reinforced with nanosized c-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} particles were fabricated in this study; the consequent formation and distribution of c-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} particles during L-L doping at the ionic level are shown in Fig. 9. The formation of nanosized yttria-stabilised cubic zirconia is attributed to the L-L incorporation of Zr\textsuperscript{4+} and Y\textsuperscript{3+} ions; Y(NO\textsubscript{3})\textsubscript{3} solution was added slowly to a ZrOCl\textsubscript{2}·8H\textsubscript{2}O solution while stirring to obtain a cluster solution [47]. Though ZrOCl\textsubscript{2}·8H\textsubscript{2}O dissolves in strong acid solutions, it undergoes hydrolysis in aqueous solutions and Cl\textsuperscript{-} ions in the outer sphere of the ionic complex are replaced by OH\textsuperscript{-} groups (Eq. (3)) [27]. Subsequently, [Zr\textsubscript{4}(OH)\textsubscript{8} 16H\textsubscript{2}O]\textsuperscript{8+} units react with the hydroxyl ions to form Zr(OH)\textsubscript{4} sols [27].

\[
\{[Zr_4(OH)8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+}8Cl^-\} + 4H_2O = \{[Zr_4(OH)8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+}8OH^-\} + 8HCl \uparrow \quad (3)
\]

However, the generated Zr(OH)\textsubscript{4} easily decomposes in acidic conditions to yield Zr\textsuperscript{4+}. During the hydrothermal reaction, W\textsubscript{12}O\textsubscript{40}\textsuperscript{8–} ions are introduced from the hydrolysis of AMT (Eq. (4)) [23] after which Zr\textsuperscript{4+} and Y\textsuperscript{3+} ions react with W\textsubscript{12}O\textsubscript{40}\textsuperscript{8–}...
ions to produce Zr(WO₄)₂ and Y₂(WO₄)₃ (Eqs. (5) and (6)) [47,54]. Y_{2}O_{3} penetrates oxygen vacancies in the zirconia lattice to form stabilized Zr(Y)O₂ during sintering [55].

\[(\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40} = 6\text{NH}_4^+ + 2\text{H}^+ + \text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}^{8-}\]  
\[(\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40} = 6\text{NH}_4^+ + 2\text{H}^+ + \text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}^{8-}\]  
\[2\text{Zr(OH)}_4 + 8\text{H}^+ + \text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}^{8-} = 8\text{WO}_3 \downarrow + 2\text{Zr(WO}_4)_2 \downarrow + 8\text{H}_2\text{O}\]  
\[2\text{Y}^{3+} + 2\text{H}^+ + \text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40}^{8-} = 9\text{WO}_3 \downarrow + \text{Y}_2(\text{WO}_4)_3 \downarrow + \text{H}_2\text{O}\]

The refining effect of oxide particle size is limited to doping with nanosized particles due to the high adsorption capacity [44,56]. In the present investigation, WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ powders were prepared by the mechanically alloying of ultrafine W-Zr(Y)O₂ powders with Ni and Fe powders. In the alloys, nanosized Zr(Y)O₂ particles with size less than 200 nm were distributed on the surface of tungsten particles. Moreover, WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ exhibited a highly uniform nanoparticle distribution when compared to alloys produced by other powder processing methods. This indicates that L-L doping and mechanical alloying, when combined together, are highly effective at reducing the particle size in strengthened tungsten alloys.

Conventionally, ODS-WHA powders are prepared by doping WHA powders with oxide particles, which often leads to oxide particle agglomeration and growth at the grain boundaries. In current research, during liquid sintering, Ni and Fe powder particles are transformed into a liquid phase, which allows the diffusion of only a small amount of tungsten. Meanwhile, some of the Zr(Y)O₂ particles at the grain boundaries of W powders are drawn into liquid phase and they are retained in the γ(Fe, Ni, and W) matrix. Eventually, most of the c-Zr(Y)O₂ particles are distributed in W grains and only a small number of c-Zr(Y)O₂ particles are distributed in the γ(Fe, Ni, and W) matrix.
3.3 Mechanism of grain refinement in WHAs

Tungsten grain growth in ODS-WHAs is mainly dependent on oxide particle refinement during sintering [10,50]. However, grain refinement is complicated due to the retardation of grain growth and coarsening under different sintering conditions. Bock et al. [57] suggested that oxide particles inhibited grain growth to prevent grain coarsening. Kang et al. [58] indicated that secondary phase particles led to an increase in grain curvature. Annavarapu et al. [59] proposed that the diffusion distance of tungsten atoms increased in the presence of large secondary phase particles. Oxide particles at the tungsten-matrix (W-M) interface can block diffusion between tungsten and the matrix, which delays grain growth during WHA liquid phase sintering [52]. The doped secondary phase particles at grain boundaries affected tungsten grain size by preventing migration along the grain boundaries and reducing the growth rate [60].

This relationship can be expressed as follows (7):

$$ R = 4r/3\phi $$

where \( R \) is the grain size of the tungsten phase, \( r \) is the radius of secondary phase particles, and \( \phi \) is the volume fraction of the secondary phase particles.

According to Eq. (7), the grain size of tungsten particles depends on the size of oxide particles; in other words, tungsten grain size can be reduced if the size of the oxide particles located at the grain boundaries decreases.

The relationship between tungsten grain size and size of the oxide particles in
ODS-WHAs observed in this study as well as in previous investigations is illustrated in Fig. 10. In general, W grain size was proportional to oxide particle size, except in the WHAs described in this study and those in Ref. [47]. These two WHAs with a large number of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles uniformly dispersed in tungsten grains are shown in the same plot; in this case, the relationship between grain size and oxide particle size was not linear. This is because of the dispersion of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles within tungsten grains, leading to a not very obvious refinement of W grains. This observation further confirms the advantages of the L-L doping for preparing intragranular particle-strengthened tungsten alloys.

Table 4 Comparison of the microstructural parameters and sintering conditions of WHAs reported in the literature and current study
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heavy tungsten alloy</th>
<th>Sintering processing parameters</th>
<th>RD (%)</th>
<th>Grain size (μm)</th>
<th>Contiguity</th>
<th>Matrix volume fraction</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-2Fe-1Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>[62]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W-4.9Ni-1.4Fe-0.7Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-3.5Ni-1Fe-0.5Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-3Fe</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0.51 ± 0.2</td>
<td>14.3 ± 3.3</td>
<td>[46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-6Ni-2Fe-Co</td>
<td>1470 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.62 ± 0.2</td>
<td>15.2 ± 2.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-5.6Ni-1.4Fe</td>
<td>1485 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe</td>
<td>1480 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>0.53 ± 0.05</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>[63]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Co</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>0.43 ± 0.01</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Re</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0.48 ± 0.06</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe</td>
<td>1520 °C (1.5h)</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>0.32 ± 0.04</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-2.8Ni-1.2Fe-Al2O3</td>
<td></td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>0.60 ± 0.06</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INERMET® IT180b**</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[64]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-3.5Ni-1.5Cu</td>
<td>1510 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[65]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96W-3Ni-1Cu</td>
<td>1510 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-4xNi-xCo</td>
<td>1600 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.2</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[45]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventional WHA**</td>
<td></td>
<td>-</td>
<td>40-60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[9]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>94W-4.56Ni-1.14Fe-Y2O3</td>
<td>1485 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99%</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>[53]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0</td>
<td>1400 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>99.5% ± 0.1</td>
<td>41 ± 2</td>
<td>0.53 ± 0.03</td>
<td>0.37 ± 0.015</td>
<td>Current</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0.75</td>
<td>1400 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>99.3% ± 0.1</td>
<td>37 ± 2</td>
<td>0.47 ± 0.03</td>
<td>0.42 ± 0.023</td>
<td>study</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a* Maximal sintering temperature and duration time
b* Heavy tungsten alloy reported in [64]
c* Microstructure and properties of the heavy tungsten alloy are not known.
The grain size of Zr(Y)O₂ particle-dispersion-strengthened WHAs described in this study was also compared with that in WHAs sintered using different methods (Table 4). The factors responsible for a fine original tungsten grain size (G₀) also contributed to grain refinement; the relationship between G₀ and refined grain size is as follows [61],

\[ G^3 = G_0^3 + Kt \]  \hspace{1cm} (8)

where G is the mean W grain size at time t, G₀ is the original average W grain size at the onset of coarsening, and K is the rate constant.

In this study, mechanical alloying was conducted to produce small W particles. Internal defects caused by the significant strain on these particles due to the high impact forces generated during ball milling serve as additional nucleation sites for strain-free grains and homogenise the grain size [66]. Fan et al. [67] indicated that mechanical alloying powders affected the mechanism of sintering and contributed to fine tungsten grains in heavy alloys.

The alloys listed in Table 4 exhibited large and coarse grains as the sintering temperature increased (>1400 °C). As sintering is a diffusion-controlled process, alloys sintered at higher temperatures exhibit higher sintering and coarsening rates [68]. Moreover, high-temperature sintering results in a constant flow of the binder
phase through pores between W grains [48] and increases the final relative sintering density. The alloys described in this study exhibit a high RD comparable with the RD of alloys reported in the literature (Table 4). This is because the high pressure applied during sintering accelerates W atom diffusion [69,70]. In addition, the oxide particles also enhance the densifications process and decrease the porosity by capturing the oxygen in the matrix.

3.4 Mechanical properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ alloys

Uniaxial tensile tests were conducted to measure the ultimate tensile strength (UTS) of WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ at room temperature (27 °C). The strengths of WHA$_0$ and WHA$_{0.5}$ were compared with those reported in literature, as shown in Fig. 11a). The ultimate tensile strengths of WHA$_0$ and WHA$_{0.50}$ were 937 and 895 MPa, respectively, which exhibit higher strengths compared to state of the art. Fig. 11b)–d) show the fracture surfaces of the failed tensile samples of 90W-7Ni-3Fe (90WHA) [9], 90W-7Ni-3Fe-0.04Y$_2$O$_3$ (90WHA-0.04Y$_2$O$_3$) [9], and WHA$_{0.50}$, respectively. As shown in Fig. 11b) and c), W-W intergranular rupture is the dominant mode of fracture in 90WHA. However, a few W grain transgranular fractures and pore surfaces are still observed in 90WHA-0.04Y$_2$O$_3$. Although the strength of present WHA$_{0.50}$ alloy is lower than that of the 90WHA-0.04Y$_2$O$_3$ alloy, WHA$_{0.50}$ shows visual evidence of W-W cleavage patterns and the ductile failure behaviour of the matrix. This contradictory situation would be researched in follow-up studies.

From these results, it may be inferred that oxide particles have a significant effect on the mechanical properties of the tested alloys. Too low or too high content of rare earth oxide additions would result in its different strengthening effect on tensile properties. Fan et al. [9] reported that WHAs with 0.4 wt.% oxide particles exhibited a tensile strength of 1124 MPa. In contrast, the additions of 0.1 wt.%, 0.8 wt.%Y$_2$O$_3$ into alloy decreased the maximal strength value of the alloy compared to WHA without Y$_2$O$_3$ (923 MPa). Lee et al. fabricated PSZ (0–0.3wt.%) dispersion-strengthened WHAs [51]; the ultimate tensile strengths of these alloys
decreased with the addition of PSZ particles (as indicated by the red symbols in Fig. 11a)). A similar phenomenon occurred with the addition of 1% Al₂O₃ and 0.1% Y₂O₃ [10,52]. In these two alloys, the additions of oxide particles both decrease the strength values of WHAs. This indicates that a non-optimal oxide content deteriorates the tensile properties of alloys.

In addition to the oxide content, the mechanical properties of alloys depend on oxide particle distribution. In case oxide particles are agglomerated, fracture initiation might occur from these areas during tensile tests. Cracks are generated at these spots and later propagate, leading to fracture [78,79]. Moreover, rare earth oxide aggregates in the matrix or at the W-M interface restrain matrix deformation, which decreases the strength and elongation of WHAs.

Fig. 11 Tensile properties and fracture surfaces of WHAs and ODS-WHAs described in the present work and literature. a) ultimate tensile strengths of WHAs and
ODS-WHAs vs. their sintering temperature, b) fracture surfaces of 90WHA [9], c) 90WHA-0.04Y2O3 [9], and d) WHA0.50

The compressive properties of WHAs reinforced with different amounts of Zr(Y)O2 particles were investigated and compared as shown in Fig. 12. The engineering stress-strain curves and the corresponding true stress-strain curves of WHA-Zr(Y)O2 were plotted at room temperature (27 °C) (Fig. 12a) and b), respectively). During compressive testing, elastic deformation occurs initially with a linear relationship between stress and strain, followed by plastic deformation in the alloy. Beyond an engineering strain of 0.813, stress increased while the strain remained constant, as shown in Fig. 12a). This indicates the high plasticity of WHAs.

The matrix phase of WHAs is softer than the tungsten phase, which determines the plastic deformation capacity of the alloys during quasi-static compression. In the alloys described in the present study, the matrix phase containing a solid Zr(Y)O2 phase exhibited good plasticity. This is due to the fact that some nanosized Zr(Y)O2 particles were uniformly distributed in the matrix with a good interface. These ultrafine oxide particles reduced stress and strain concentration during compressive deformation [80].

Based on the true stress-strain curves in Fig. 12b), the WHA containing 0.5% Zr(Y)O2 exhibited the best strengthening behaviour among all the tested alloys. The ultimate compressive strength of WHA0.50 was 1445 MPa, which was higher than that of the other three alloys. Furthermore, we observed that the ultimate compressive strength obtained during plastic deformation is affected by the strain rate; to illustrate this phenomenon, we tested the alloy samples at strain rates of 10^{-3}, 10^{-2}, 10^{-1}, and 1 s^{-1}, as shown in Fig. 13.

Fig. 13a) indicates that WHA-Zr(Y)O2 exhibited excellent plasticity at different strain rates. The ultimate stress increased with an increase in the strain rate, as shown in Fig. 13b). An ultimate stress of 1445 MPa was achieved at 10^{-3} s^{-1}. The compressive strength of WHA0.50 was higher than that of several previously reported alloys, as shown in Fig. 13c). This higher value of strength may be due to the proper amount of Zr(Y)O2 particles and higher dispersed nanoparticles distribution. When the
strain rate increases to 1 s\(^{-1}\), the peak stress increases to 1560 MPa. On the one hand, a high strain rate enhances dislocation density and work hardening. On the other hand, the change of phase’ deformation behaviors may be another main reason. The deformed microstructures produced at different strain rates are shown to illustrate the plastic deformation behaviour of WHA-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) (Fig. 14a–d)).

During compression, the matrix phase is the first to deform. When tests are conducted at low strain rates, the matrix phase has sufficient time to deform and flow between tungsten particles, as confirmed by the slightly elongated microstructure of tungsten grains in Fig. 14a). With the further increasing of plastic deformation, the matrix phase causes work hardening by plastic deformation, which induces a simultaneous deformation in some tungsten particles. The deformation resistance of the matrix phase depends on the oxide particles used to reinforce it. When the strain rate during compression increases, there is not enough time for the matrix phase to flow between W particles, owing to which it gradually transmits stress to W grains, leading to their deformation. Beyond a critical strain rate, the deformation resistance of the alloy mainly depends on the tungsten phase. Therefore, W particles were seriously elongated at 1 s\(^{-1}\), as shown in Fig. 14d).

![Graphs](image_url)

**Fig. 12** a) Room temperature (27 °C) engineering stress-strain curves and b) true stress-strain curves of WHAs with different mass fractions of Zr(Y)O\(_2\). Compression tests were conducted at a constant strain rate of 10\(^{-3}\) s\(^{-1}\).
Fig. 13 a) Room temperature (27 °C) engineering stress-strain curves and b) true stress-strain curves of WHA$_{0.50}$ generated during compression tests at different strain rates. c) Comparison of the compressive true stress-strain curve of WHA$_{0.50}$ with those of previously reported alloys.
Fig. 14 Microstructure of WHA$_{0.75}$ after compression tests at room temperature (27 °C) at strain rates of a) $10^{-3}$, b) $10^{-2}$, c) $10^{-1}$, and d) 1 s$^{-1}$

4. Conclusion

(1) WHAs strengthened by highly uniform nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were fabricated by hydrothermal processing followed by mechanical alloying and hot isostatic pressing.

(2) Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles bonded well with the tungsten phase; they were smaller than 200 nm in size and were distributed uniformly in tungsten grains and the matrix. TEM analysis indicated the presence of a large number of nanosized oxide particles smaller than 50 nm in the alloy microstructure.

(3) The size of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles synthesised using combined hydrothermal and mechanical alloying methods is much smaller than that in alloys previously reported; this small size also helped in tungsten grain refinement.
(4) The ultimate tensile and maximal compressive strengths of the fabricated alloys under quasi-static deformation at room temperature (27 °C) were 895 and 1420 MPa, respectively, which are much higher than the values reported in literature. The effect of Zr(Y)O₂ particles and strain rate on the compressive properties of the alloys were investigated in detail and the corresponding compressive deformation mechanisms were discussed.

Declaration of interest
There are no conflicts to declare.

Acknowledgments
National Natural Science Foundation of China [No. U2004180, No. 51874185], Henan Province Science and Technology Innovation Talent Plan [No. 2017JQ0012] and Graduate Research and Innovation & Practice Projects in Jiangsu Province [No. KYCX19_0182]. The EIPHI Graduate School (contract ANR-17-EURE-0002) also has supported this work.

References


ZrO$_2$ content on microstructure and mechanical properties of W alloys fabricated 

[37] Z. Li, L. J. Xu, S. Z. Wei, C. Chen, F. N. Xiao, Fabrication and mechanical 
properties of tungsten alloys reinforced with c-ZrO$_2$ particles, J. Alloys Compd. 

[38] Y. Shen, Z. Xu, K. Cui, J. Yu, Microstructure of a commercial W-1% La$_2$O$_3$ 


[40] M. A. Yar, S. Wahlberg, H. Bergqvist, H. G. Salem, M. Johnsson, M. 
Muhammed, Spark plasma sintering of tungsten-yttrium oxide composites from 
chemically synthesised nanopowders and microstructural characterization, J. Nucl. 

[41] A. Muñoz, M. A. Monge, B. Savoini, M. E. Rabanal, G. Garces, R. Pareja, 
La$_2$O$_3$-reinforced W and W-V alloys produced by hot isostatic pressing, J. Nucl. 

Mechanical properties and microstructures of W-1%Y$_2$O$_3$ microalloyed with Zr, 

temperature oxides dispersion strengthened tungsten composites by spark plasma 
https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijrmhm.2009.03.003.


[52] K. Hu, X. Li, X. Ai, S. Qu, Y. Li, Fabrication, characterization, and mechanical properties of 93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe/95W-2.8Ni-1.2Fe-1Al2O3 heavy alloy composites,


Graphical Abstract

Hydrothermal self-assembly
Dispersing NH$_4^+$
Containing Zr phase
Grain boundaries
500 nm

[Graphical Abstract Image]

Hydrothermal self-assembly
Dispersing NH$_4^+$
Containing Zr phase
Grain boundaries
500 nm

[Graphical Abstract Image]
Highlights

1. Highly uniform nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were fabricated by liquid doping.

2. W alloys were fabricated by a combined hydrothermal and mechanical alloying method.

3. Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles (< 200 nm), are much smaller than those reported in literature.

4. W alloys containing nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ exhibited excellent mechanical properties.
Author Contribution Statement

Fangnao Xiao and Qiang Miao: methodology, analysis and writing-original draft preparation;
Shizhong Wei, Liujie Xu and Shiwei Zuo: experiments and analysis;
Thierry Barriere and Gang Cheng: analysis and writing-editing.
Declaration of interests

The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.
Extremely uniform nanosized oxide particles dispersion strengthened tungsten alloy with high tensile and compressive strengths fabricated involving liquid-liquid method

Fangnao Xiao\textsuperscript{a,b}, Thierry Barriere\textsuperscript{b}, Gang Cheng\textsuperscript{c}, Qiang Miao\textsuperscript{a*}, Shiwei Zuo\textsuperscript{a}, Shizhong Wei\textsuperscript{d*}, Liujie Xu\textsuperscript{d*}

\textsuperscript{a} College of Material Science and Technology, Nanjing University of Aeronautics and Astronautics, 29 Yudao Street, Nanjing 210000, China

\textsuperscript{b} Université Bourgogne Franche-Comté, FEMTO-ST Institute, CNRS/UFC/ENSMM/UTBM, Department of Applied Mechanics, 25000 Besançon, France

\textsuperscript{c} INSA CVL, Université Tours, Université Orléans, LaMé, 3 rue de la Chocolaterie, BP 3410, 41034 Blois Cedex, France

\textsuperscript{d} National Joint Engineering Research Center for abrasion control and molding of metal materials, Henan University of Science and Technology, Luoyang 471003, China

E-mail addresses of Corresponding author:

miaojiaqiang@nuaa.edu.cn (Qiang Miao)

wsz@haust.edu.cn (Shizhong Wei)

xlj@haust.edu.cn (Liujie Xu)

Full postal address:

FEMTO-ST Institute, Department of Applied Mechanics, 24 chemin de l’épitaphe, 25000, Besançon, France

Tel.: +33381666000
Abstract

In this study, tungsten heavy alloys reinforced with highly uniform and dispersed nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were investigated. These alloys exhibited a high compressive strength and enhanced plasticity. To fabricate these alloys, we used a novel process involving molecular level liquid-liquid doping combined with hot isostatic pressing. The Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles thus produced were smaller than 200 nm in size and bonded well with tungsten grains. The size of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles and tungsten grains are much smaller than those of the state-of-the-art review and the details of the grain refinement mechanisms were discussed. The effect of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles and strain rate on the compressive properties of the alloys was investigated in detail and the corresponding compressive deformation mechanisms were elucidated. The highest ultimate tensile and compressive strengths of the fabricated alloys at room temperature (27°C) were 906 and 1445 MPa, respectively, which are higher than most of reported values in the literature. The ultimate tensile strength and fracture strain of WHAs decrease with the mass fraction of Zr(Y)O$_2$ (from 0 to 0.75%). The alloys exhibit the brittle material behaviour in tension, compared to the pure tungsten with ductile material behaviour. The tensile fracture surface consists of W - W cleavage patterns and ductile failure of the matrix. The results obtained in this research will act as basic guidelines for the fabrication of ODS-W alloys by liquid-liquid doping process.

Keywords: Tungsten heavy alloys; oxide particle strengthening; zirconia; liquid-liquid doping; compressive strength; hot isostatic pressing

Nomenclature

α-HATB       Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$
β-HATB       Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze (NH$_4$)$_{0.42}$WO$_3$
AMT          Ammonium metatungstate
APT          Ammonium paratungstate
DUAs         Depleted uranium alloys
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EDS</td>
<td>Energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HATB</td>
<td>Hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze, (NH$_4$)$_x$WO$_3$</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HIP</td>
<td>Hot isostatic pressing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR-TEM</td>
<td>High-resolution transmission electron microscopy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HV</td>
<td>Vickers hardness</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L-L</td>
<td>Liquid-liquid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>L-S</td>
<td>Liquid-solid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MA</td>
<td>Mechanical alloying</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODS-W</td>
<td>Oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ODS-WHAs</td>
<td>Oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten heavy alloys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PSZ</td>
<td>Partially stabilised zirconia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RD</td>
<td>Relative densities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SAED</td>
<td>Selected area electron diffraction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SEM</td>
<td>Scanning electron microscopy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>Spark plasma sintering</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>S-S</td>
<td>Solid-solid</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UTS</td>
<td>Ultimate tensile strength</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VD</td>
<td>Sintering process in the vertical direction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHAs</td>
<td>Tungsten heavy alloys</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$</td>
<td>Zr(Y)O$_2$ particle dispersion-strengthened 93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-M</td>
<td>Tungsten-matrix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-W</td>
<td>Tungsten-tungsten</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>XRD</td>
<td>X-ray diffraction</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
1. Introduction

Tungsten heavy alloys (WHAs) are promising materials for kinetic energy penetrators, radiation shields, and rocket nozzles, owing to their moderate ductility, high density, and quasi-static strength [1-4]. In particular, WHAs are more suitable for use in kinetic energy penetrators than depleted uranium alloys (DUAs) as they pose no risk of radioactive contamination [5]. Furthermore, they exhibit a lower penetration performance (by ~20%) than DUAs at high strain rates [6,7].

Generally, the penetration capability of WHAs depends on their strength and toughness [8]. The existing WHAs obtained using conventional powder metallurgy are limited to anti-armour penetrators owing to the weak mechanical properties of coarse tungsten grains [9]. In recent years, a large number of researchers have focused on improving the mechanical performance of WHA penetrators by inducing microstructural changes [10-12] via changing the WHA composition by adding alloying elements or rare earth oxides (Y₂O₃, La₂O₃, ZrO₂, ThO₂, and CeO₂) [13-16] or by microstructural refinement [17-20].

Grain refinement in tungsten is known to significantly enhance its mechanical properties. However, the grain size of WHAs depends partially on the particle size of the initial powders. In the past few years, liquid-liquid (L-L) doping techniques have been developed for oxide particle-doped tungsten powders. Xu et al. fabricated La₂O₃-doped ultra-fine tungsten powders using Na₂WO₄·2H₂O and La(NO₃)₃·6H₂O as the raw materials [21]. Nanosized La₂O₃-doped tungsten powders with a particle size of ~700 nm were realised by hydrogen reduction. Dong et al. synthesised Y₂O₃-doped nanosized tungsten powders with an average particle size of 40–50 nm via a wet-chemical process [22]. Xiao et al. used the hydrothermal method coupled with hydrogen reduction to develop nanocrystal powders of W-Zr(Y)O₂ with an average particle size of 30 nm [23]; these oxides were used as nucleation cores in tungsten for particle refinement. Rare earth elements (such as Y, Zr and La) decrease the number of O and P impurities aggregating at the interface and thus improve the performance of WHA penetrators [24]. In addition, nanosized oxide particles can lead to dispersion strengthening and grain refinement, thus increasing the strength and
ductility of the alloys fabricated by L-L doping [25,26]. Therefore, L-L doping with nanosized oxide particles is considered to be an effective approach for improving the mechanical performance of WHAs.

In this study, a novel material based on dispersion-strengthened 93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloys [WHA-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2}] using nanosized Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} is proposed. WHA-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} was prepared by a hydrothermal method combined with mechanical alloying (MA). Nanosized Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} dispersion-strengthened WHAs were fabricated by conventional solid-phase sintering and hot isostatic pressing (HIP). The uniaxial tensile and compressive properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} were estimated and the effect of Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} on the microstructure and mechanical properties of the WHAs were investigated. These microstructural characteristics and mechanical properties (tensile and compressive) of the present WHA-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} alloys under various solicitations were compared with those of the state-of-the-art WHA materials to demonstrate the effectiveness of the proposed method. It indicates that the fabricated alloys exhibit smaller size of tungsten grains and oxide particles, and higher ultimate tensile and compressive strengths.

This article is structured as follows. In Section 2, the sample preparation and characterisation processes are described in detail. In Section 3, our observations on powder morphology, WHA microstructure, and the mechanical properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} alloys are described with reference to the relevant literature. Finally, our major conclusions are presented in Section 4.

2. Experimental procedure

2.1 Sample preparation

In the present work, four W-Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} powders were prepared using the process shown in Fig. 1. The composition of the alloy powders contained varying amounts of Zr(Y)O\textsubscript{2} (0, 0.25, 0.5, and 0.75 wt.% denoted as WHA\textsubscript{0}, WHA\textsubscript{0.25}, WHA\textsubscript{0.50} and WHA\textsubscript{0.75}, respectively, as listed in Table 1). The commercial raw materials included zirconium oxychloride octahydrate (ZrOCl\textsubscript{2}·8H\textsubscript{2}O; grade AR), yttrium nitrate [Y(NO\textsubscript{3})\textsubscript{3}·6H\textsubscript{2}O; grade AR] and ammonium metatungstate [(NH\textsubscript{4})\textsubscript{6}H\textsubscript{2}W\textsubscript{12}O\textsubscript{40}·5H\textsubscript{2}O;
grade AR; AMT]. The supplier of ZrOCl₂·8H₂O and Y(NO₃)₃·6H₂O powders was Shanghai Diyang Industrial Co., LTD. The AMT powder was provided by Wuhan Kabuda Chemical Co., LTD. The synthesis and reduction of W-Zr(Y)O₂ powders were carried out according to previously described protocols [27]. After hydrothermal treatment, the precursor consisted of hexagonal (NH₄)₀.₃₃·WO₃·(α-hexagonal ammonium tungsten bronze, α-HATB, PDF# 42-0452), as shown in Fig. 2a). The reduction process included the following stages – a first reduction step at 500 °C for 1.5 h resulting in hexagonal (NH₄)₀.₄₂WO₃ (β-HATB, PDF#42-0451), which is expected to produce high-quality doped tungsten powders and alloys [27], and a second reduction reaction at 800 °C for 2 h to yield W-Zr(Y)O₂ powder. After hydrogen reduction, the (NH₄)₀.₄₂WO₃ was transformed into α-W.

W-Zr(Y)O₂ alloys were fabricated by Hot isostatic pressing (HIP) at 2000 °C for 5 min at 30 MPa. MA was conducted to blend elemental Ni, Fe, and W-Zr(Y)O₂ powders at the appropriate proportions. A planetary ball mill was used at a milling speed of 250 rpm for 6 h. The milling media consisted of 3 mm diameter tungsten carbide balls with ball-to-powder ratio of 10:1. The milled powders were compacted into cylindrical rods by cold isostatic pressing at 250 MPa. Subsequently, the green compacts were sintered at 1250 °C for 1 h in a hydrogen atmosphere. These samples were later sintered by hot isostatic pressing at 1400 °C for 2 h at 180 MPa. Fig. 2b) shows the X-ray diffraction (XRD) pattern of WHA₀.₇₅, which suggests the presence of W and γ(Fe, Ni) phases.
Fig. 1 Schematic diagram of the synthesis of WHAs

Table 1 Chemical composition of WHA-Zr(Y)O2 alloys (wt.%)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Samples</th>
<th>W</th>
<th>Fe</th>
<th>Ni</th>
<th>ZrO2</th>
<th>Y2O3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>WHA0</td>
<td>93.000</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.00</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0.25</td>
<td>92.720</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.25</td>
<td>0.03</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0.50</td>
<td>92.440</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.50</td>
<td>0.06</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0.75</td>
<td>92.156</td>
<td>2.1</td>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.09</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Fig. 2 XRD patterns of a) powder precursor and doped reduced powder and b) WHA0.75
The microstructure of the fabricated powders and alloys was evaluated by scanning electron microscopy (SEM), energy dispersive X-ray spectroscopy (EDS), and high-resolution transmission electron microscopy (HR-TEM). XRD analysis was conducted on the produced powders and alloys to identify their crystalline phases. The absolute densities of the alloys were determined using Archimedes’ principle and theoretical densities were calculated based on the theoretical mass and volume. Relative density (RD) was calculated as the ratio of absolute and theoretical densities.

Vickers hardness (HV) testing was conducted with a 200 g indenting load and a dwell time of 20 s using the HVS-1000 digital micro Vickers hardness tester. The obtained value represented the average of values sourced from ten random positions on the alloy cross-section. Grain-size data was acquired using a line intercept method and at least 100 identifiable grains were considered for this measurement. Tungsten-tungsten (W-W) contiguity (\(C_{WW}\)), which is defined as the relative fraction of the W-W interfacial area, was estimated according to Eq. (1) [28],

\[
C_{WW} = \frac{2N_{WW}}{N_{WW} + N_{WM}}
\]

where \(N_{WW}\) and \(N_{WM}\) indicate the number of W-W grain boundaries and tungsten-matrix (W-M) interfaces intercepted by an arbitrary straight line per unit length in the SEM images, respectively.

Tensile properties were measured on a universal testing machine (Instron-5967) at a constant loading rate of 0.3 mm/min at room temperature (27 °C). The average of three measured values is reported as the tensile strength of a given sample; specimen dimension is shown in Fig. 3.

![Fig. 3 Dimension of tensile testing specimens (all units are in mm)](image-url)
The compressive properties of the samples were measured on a universal material machine (Shimadzu AG-I250kN) at strain rates of $10^{-3}$, $10^{-2}$, $10^{-1}$, and 1 s$^{-1}$. Cylindrical samples with a diameter and length of 6 and 10 mm, respectively, were used for this purpose.

3. Results and discussions

3.1 Precursor morphology and Zr(Y)O$_2$ particle size and distribution

The morphology of the precursors synthesised using the hydrothermal method is illustrated in Fig. 4. The precursor consisted of nanoplates, with a diameter of less than 20 nm and length of ~100 nm, as shown in Fig. 4a). The lattice fringe image indicated a spacing of 0.384 nm, corresponding to the (002) plane of hexagonal (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·H$_2$O and this indicates the growth of nanoplates along the c axis [29].

Primary crystals (WO$_3$·nH$_2$O) precipitated from the crystal cell were initially formed by the hydrothermal reaction (Eq. (2)) between (H$_2$W$_{12}$O$_{40}$)$^{6-}$ and H$^+$ [23]. Tungsten atoms in WO$_3$·nH$_2$O are bound to six oxygen atoms in a regular octahedral coordination pattern, as shown in Fig. 4d). Each oxygen atom is shared by two octahedrons, which are arranged in layers to form six-membered rings and then form numerous hexagonal and trigonal tunnels by sharing equatorial oxygen in the ab plane (001) [30-32]. These rings are usually stacked by sharing oxygen along the c axis [001] and form hexagonal prisms. At the same time, due to their high concentration, NH$_4^+$ ions in the hydrothermal system occupied the hexagonal tunnels [33,34], thus accelerating the growth of hexagonal-prism-like WO$_3$ in the [001] direction and the formation of hierarchical (NH$_4$)$_{0.33}$WO$_3$·H$_2$O nanoplates. The presence of NH$_4^+$ and H$^+$ can contribute to the formation of urchin-like h-WO$_3$ microspheres, as shown in Fig. 4b). During the hydrothermal reaction, numerous tiny WO$_3$ crystals nucleate and grow into WO$_3$ nanoplates due to the orientation effect of NH$_4^+$; these crystals self-assemble to form microspheres to reduce surface energy. The high concentration of NH$_4^+$ around WO$_3$ microspheres accelerates the oriented growth of WO$_3$. Thus, numerous nanoplates grow epitaxially from the surface of a microsphere. This may be due to the addition of ions (Zr$^{4+}$, Y$^{3+}$, and Cl$^-$) to the hydrothermal system and
breakage of order between the positive and negative charges destroying the self-assembly process, which leads to the transformation of agglomerated microspheres into relatively disperse cotton-like precursors.

\[(\text{NH}_4)_6\text{H}_2\text{W}_{12}\text{O}_{40} \cdot x\text{H}_2\text{O} + 6\text{HNO}_3 = 6\text{NH}_4\text{NO}_3 + 12\text{WO}_3 \cdot n\text{H}_2\text{O} + (8-x)\text{H}_2\text{O}\]  

Fig. 4 Experimental observations and a schematic of α-HATB synthesis. a) TEM image of the undoped precursor, b) SEM image of the undoped precursor, c) SEM image of the doped precursor containing the (Zr, Y) phase, and d) illustration of morphology evolution in the (NH₄)₀.₃₃WO₃·H₂O precursor

The size of oxide particles and their distribution in tungsten powders and alloys were studied (Fig. 5). A SEM image of the powder reduced at the optimised processing parameters is shown in Fig 5a). The powder particles exhibited small diameter and excellent dispersion, which is beneficial for increasing the uniformity and density of the microstructure during sintering. Further, nanoscale white particles, composed of Zr(Y)O₂, were scattered on the surfaces of tungsten particles, as shown
in Fig. 5a).  

SPS was conducted to produce W-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) alloys and investigate the effect of Zr(Y)O\(_2\) particle size and distribution on the alloy microstructure, as shown in Fig. 5b). Oxide particle size was found to be uneven in the range of 100–500 nm. According to the magnified image of the selected area in Fig. 5b\(_1\)), a large number of white particles were found to be distributed within the grains, which helped in enhancing material properties. Moreover, a large number of nanoparticles (50 nm) were found to be distributed within the microstructure, as observed by TEM. A strong bonding was thus formed between the particles and tungsten phase even though there was no phase coherence between tungsten and the oxide, as shown in Fig. 5c\(_1\)).

Fig. 5 Morphology and microstructure of W-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) powders and alloys obtained using the proposed approach. a and a\(_1\)) SEM images of the morphology of the W-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) powder. b and b\(_1\)) SEM images of the microstructure of the W-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) alloy. c and c\(_1\)) TEM and HR-TEM images of the W-Zr(Y)O\(_2\) alloy.

The microstructure and mechanical properties of oxide particle dispersion-strengthened tungsten alloys (ODS-W) fabricated in this study were
compared with those reported earlier (alloys with the same or similar composition obtained by different processes as shown in Table 2). Fast sintering techniques, such as HIP, SPS, and sintering in vertical direction (VD), eliminate oxide particle growth. From Table 2, it may be inferred that L-L methods are better at yielding fine oxide particles in ODS-W alloys than L-S and S-S methods [35-37]. However, the size of these particles varied widely at 3.6, 1.5, and 2.5 μm. They were still much coarser than the oxide particles synthesised in tungsten alloys using the approach proposed in the current study. A similar observation could be made for ODS-W alloys fabricated by L-S methods. Yar et al. [40] prepared nanosized W-Y_2O_3 alloy by L-S doping. However, these Y_2O_3 particles were non-uniformly distributed in the tungsten matrix as the reaction occurred at the surfaces of the raw material alone (ammonium paratungstate, APT). Nanosized oxide particles were used as raw materials in S-S doping, but a large adsorption effect led to particle aggregation even after 30 h of ball milling [43]. In current research, the oxide particles obtained in tungsten alloys using the current approach were 0.8–10 times smaller when compared to those described in previous reports. This difference indicates that the proposed L-L doping process is appropriate to reduce particle size in tungsten alloys.

Table 2 Comparison of the microstructure and mechanical properties of ODS-W alloys

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Doping process</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>Alloy</th>
<th>W grain size (μm)</th>
<th>Oxide particle size (μm)</th>
<th>Density (g/cm^3)/Relative density (%)</th>
<th>Microhardness (HV)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>L-L</td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-6vol% Al_2O_3</td>
<td>3.64</td>
<td>&gt;1.0</td>
<td>-94.96</td>
<td>347.39</td>
<td>[35]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-2.5%ZrO_2</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>-99.6</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>[36]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VD</td>
<td>W-2.5%ZrO_2</td>
<td>40-80</td>
<td>1.5</td>
<td>-98.7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[37]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>VD</td>
<td>W-La_2O_3</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[38]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-0.9wt.%La_2O_3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>17.8/94</td>
<td>406</td>
<td>[39]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>SPS</td>
<td>W-1.0%Y_2O_3</td>
<td>2.3</td>
<td>Nanosize</td>
<td>17.5/92</td>
<td>423</td>
<td>[40]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


3.2 Microstructure of WHAs

The morphology of WHA$_{0.75}$ powder produced by MA of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powder with Ni and Fe powders is shown in Fig. 6a). It can be observed that the structure of the WHA$_{0.75}$ powder is much looser than that of W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ (Fig. 5a)). The microstructures of WHAs with different weight ratios of Zr(Y)O$_2$ are shown in Fig. 6(b–d). According to Fig. 6b), spherical tungsten grains are embedded in the matrix phase due to liquid-phase formation during sintering at 1400 °C [44]. It could be confirmed that the grain size of WHA$_{0.75}$ is smaller than that of WHA$_0$ after comparing the average size of 100 grains. W grains in alloys with and without Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were uneven in size; the growth of W grains during liquid-phase sintering may be explained by Ostwald ripening [45]. In the current experimental conditions, smaller particles reprecipitated on larger tungsten grains during their dissolution in the matrix [46].

Moreover, grain contiguity reduced slightly as the grain size decreased, similar to previously reported results [47]. The reason for the decrease in W-W contiguity is that Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles induce the liquid phase $\gamma$(Fe$_{0.64}$N$_{0.36}$) to infiltrate W grain boundaries during sintering [48]. Thus, tungsten grains are gradually covered by the $\gamma$(Fe$_{0.64}$N$_{0.36}$) phase to enhance the mechanical properties of oxide particle dispersion-strengthened WHAs (ODS-WHAs).

A magnified image of the area enclosed in red in Fig. 6c) is presented in Fig. 6d) to understand the microstructure of WHA$_{0.75}$ in further detail. A large number of
white particles with similar particle size of less than 200 nm could be observed. These Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were dispersed in W grains. Generally, large oxide particles induce stress/strain concentration for crack initiation and reduce the fracture toughness of an alloy [49]. Therefore, nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles (such as those in the present alloy) obtained by the proposed process are expected to enhance the mechanical properties of WHAs.

Fig. 6 SEM images of the microstructure of a) WHA$_{0.75}$, b) WHA$_0$, and c) and d) WHA$_{0.75}$ at 500x and 5000x, respectively.

The microstructure of WHA$_{0.75}$ after quasi-static compressive loading at room temperature (27 °C) was characterized by TEM. As shown in Fig. 7a)–c), oxide nanoparticles with prismatic and subspherical structure exhibited different particle sizes. In Fig. 7a), it may be observed that the prismatic particles surrounded by a black phase were ~200 nm in size. In Fig. 7b) and c), it can be seen that subspherical particles smaller than 50 nm were embedded in shallow phases consisting of Ni, Fe,
and W, as described by EDS. White cubic nanocrystalline Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were detected in the selected area electron diffraction (SAED) pattern in the inset of Fig. 7a). Dislocation substructures are marked by white arrows in the matrix phase, as shown in Fig. 7c). Meanwhile, Fig. 7d) illustrates a well-bonded interface between the tungsten phase and Zr(Y)O$_2$ even though there was no coherent relationship.

Fig. 7 a) and b) TEM images of WHA$_{0.75}$, c) TEM image of the matrix phase, and d) HRTEM image of the Zr(Y)O$_2$/W interface

The microstructures of several heavy tungsten alloys reinforced by ZrO$_2$ particles are shown in Fig. 8 and Table 3. Daoush et al. [49] fabricated W-Ni-ZrO$_2$ alloys by conventional sintering at 1500 °C for 1 h. The ZrO$_2$ particles in these alloys ranged from 0.5 to 3 μm in size, as shown in Fig. 8a), and they were almost at or close to the grain boundaries. Lee et al. [51] fabricated partially stabilised zirconia (PSZ) dispersion-strengthened WHAs by two-step MA to control the location of oxide
particles. However, the PSZ particles in the alloys still grew to be as large as 1.5 μm, as shown in Fig. 8b), and some adhesive oxide particles marked by red arrows could be observed. Xu et al. [47] studied Zr(Y)O₂ dispersion-strengthened 92.5W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe alloys using azeotropic distillation process. In these alloys, the Zr(Y)O₂ particles were 200–1000 nm large, as shown in Fig. 8c). Wang et al. [36] synthesised W-ZrO₂ alloys using a combination of the hydrothermal method and SPS. In this case, agglomerated precursors could be detected and the adhesive ZrO₂ particles grew to 3 μm, as shown in Fig. 8d). Larger oxide particles obtained by different powder preparation processes are observed in tungsten or heavy tungsten alloys, as summarised in Table 3. These oxide particles fabricated by the previous processes are larger than those through the developed process in the current research. Non-uniformly distributed coarse particles induce uneven stress and strain distribution around these reinforced particles, weakening the alloys. The proposed process is proved to be appropriate for the fabrication of the dispersion-strengthening tungsten alloys with ultrafine nanosized Zr(Y)O₂ particles.
Fig. 8 Microstructures of WHAs reinforced by ZrO$_2$ particles. a) W-Ni-ZrO$_2$ [49], b) W-Ni-Fe-PSZ [51], c) W-Ni-Fe-ZrO$_2$ [47], and d) W-ZrO$_2$ [36]

Table 3 Microstructure and mechanical properties of ODS-WHA reported in the literature and in the current study

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heavy tungsten alloy</th>
<th>Powder preparation process</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>RD (%)</th>
<th>Grain size (μm)</th>
<th>Particle size (μm)</th>
<th>Hardness (HV)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-ZrO$_2$</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1500°C (1 h)</td>
<td>93.5</td>
<td>~25</td>
<td>3-5</td>
<td>333</td>
<td>[50]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-0.3PSZ</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1480°C (1 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[51]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe-Zr(Y)O$_2$</td>
<td>L-L doping</td>
<td>1520°C (2.5 h)</td>
<td>99.2</td>
<td>28</td>
<td>0.5-1</td>
<td>402</td>
<td>[47]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-2.5%ZrO$_2$</td>
<td>L-L doping, SPS</td>
<td>1800°C (5 min)</td>
<td>99.6</td>
<td>4.65</td>
<td>2.5</td>
<td>480</td>
<td>[36]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-1Al$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>Blending process</td>
<td>1480°C (2 h)</td>
<td>98.3</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-xY$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1850°C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>19.5</td>
<td>0.6-1.3</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Co-Y$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1450°C (1 h)</td>
<td>94.1</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>&gt;0.6</td>
<td>425</td>
<td>[44]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-4.56Ni-1.14Fe-Y$_2$O$_3$</td>
<td>MA</td>
<td>1485°C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.0</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[53]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-ODS alloys</td>
<td>SPS/HP</td>
<td>&lt;99.9</td>
<td>&lt;10</td>
<td>1-5</td>
<td>406-480</td>
<td>[27]</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

a* These W-ODS powders were prepared by different doping processes, seeing Table 5 in references [27]
Intracrystalline heavy tungsten alloys reinforced with nanosized c-Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were fabricated in this study; the consequent formation and distribution of c-Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles during L-L doping at the ionic level are shown in Fig. 9. The formation of nanosized yttria-stabilised cubic zirconia is attributed to the L-L incorporation of Zr$^{4+}$ and Y$^{3+}$ ions; Y(NO$_3$)$_3$ solution was added slowly to a ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O solution while stirring to obtain a cluster solution [47]. Though ZrOCl$_2$·8H$_2$O dissolves in strong acid solutions, it undergoes hydrolysis in aqueous solutions and Cl$^-$ ions in the outer sphere of the ionic complex are replaced by OH$^-$ groups (Eq. (3)) [27]. Subsequently, [Zr$_4$(OH)$_8$·16H$_2$O]$^{8+}$ units react with the hydroxyl ions to form Zr(OH)$_4$ sols [27].

\[
{[Zr_4(OH)_8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+} + 4H_2O = [Zr_4(OH)_8\cdot16H_2O]^{8+} + 8OH^- + 8HCl↑}
\]  

However, the generated Zr(OH)$_4$ easily decomposes in acidic conditions to yield Zr$^{4+}$. During the hydrothermal reaction, W$_{12}$O$_{40}$$^{8-}$ ions are introduced from the hydrolysis of AMT (Eq. (4)) [23] after which Zr$^{4+}$ and Y$^{3+}$ ions react with W$_{12}$O$_{40}$$^{8-}$ ions to produce Zr(WO$_4$)$_2$ and Y$_2$(WO$_4$)$_3$ (Eqs. (5) and (6)) [47,54]. Y$_2$O$_3$ penetrates oxygen vacancies in the zirconia lattice to form stabilized Zr(Y)O$_2$ during sintering [55].

\[
(NH_4)_6H_2W_{12}O_{40} = 6NH_4^+ + 2H^+ + W_{12}O_{40}^{8-}
\]

\[
2Zr(OH)_4 + 8H^+ + W_{12}O_{40}^{8-} = 8WO_3↓ + 2Zr(WO_4)_2↓ + 8H_2O
\]

\[
2Y^{3+} + 2H^+ + W_{12}O_{40}^{8-} = 9WO_3↓ + Y_2(WO_4)_3↓ + H_2O
\]

The refining effect of oxide particle size is limited to doping with nanosized particles due to the high adsorption capacity [44,56]. In the present investigation, WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powders were prepared by the mechanically alloying of ultrafine W-Zr(Y)O$_2$ powders with Ni and Fe powders. In the alloys, nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles with size less than 200 nm were distributed on the surface of tungsten particles. Moreover, WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ exhibited a highly uniform nanoparticle distribution when compared to alloys produced by other powder processing methods. This indicates that L-L doping and MA, when combined together, are highly effective at reducing the particle size in strengthened tungsten alloys.
Conventionally, ODS-WHA powders are prepared by doping WHA powders with oxide particles, which often leads to oxide particle agglomeration and growth at the grain boundaries. In current research, during liquid sintering, Ni and Fe powder particles are transformed into a liquid phase, which allows the diffusion of only a small amount of tungsten. Meanwhile, some of the Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles at the grain boundaries of W powders are drawn into liquid phase and they are retained in the $\gamma$(Fe, Ni, and W) matrix. Eventually, most of the c-Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles are distributed in W grains and only a small number of c-Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles are distributed in the $\gamma$(Fe, Ni, and W) matrix.

![Fig. 9 Schematic of microstructural development during alloy fabrication](image)

### 3.3 Mechanism of grain refinement in WHAs

Tungsten grain growth in ODS-WHAs is mainly dependent on oxide particle refinement during sintering [10,50]. However, grain refinement is complicated due to the retardation of grain growth and coarsening under different sintering conditions. Bock et al. [57] suggested that oxide particles inhibited grain growth to prevent grain coarsening. Kang et al. [58] indicated that secondary phase particles led to an increase in grain curvature. Annavarapu et al. [59] proposed that the diffusion distance of tungsten atoms increased in the presence of large secondary phase particles. Oxide particles at the tungsten-matrix (W-M) interface can block diffusion between tungsten and the matrix, which delays grain growth during WHA liquid phase sintering [52]. The doped secondary phase particles at grain boundaries affected tungsten grain size.
by preventing migration along the grain boundaries and reducing the growth rate [60].

This relationship can be expressed as follows (7):

\[ R = \frac{4r}{3\varphi} \]  

(7)

where \( R \) is the grain size of the tungsten phase, \( r \) is the radius of secondary phase particles, and \( \varphi \) is the volume fraction of the secondary phase particles.

According to Eq. (7), the grain size of tungsten particles depends on the size of oxide particles; in other words, tungsten grain size can be reduced if the size of the oxide particles located at the grain boundaries decreases.

The relationship between tungsten grain size and size of the oxide particles in ODS-WHAs observed in this study as well as in previous investigations is illustrated in Fig. 10. In general, W grain size was proportional to oxide particle size, except in the WHAs described in this study and those in Ref. [47]. These two WHAs with a large number of Zr(Y)O\(_2\) particles uniformly dispersed in tungsten grains are shown in the same plot; in this case, the relationship between grain size and oxide particle size was not linear. This is because of the dispersion of Zr(Y)O\(_2\) particles within tungsten grains, leading to a not obvious refinement of W grains. This observation further confirms the advantages of the L-L doping for preparing intragranular particle-strengthened tungsten alloys.

Table 4 Comparison of the microstructural parameters and sintering conditions of WHAs reported in the literature and current study
### Sintering Processing Parameters

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Heavy tungsten alloy</th>
<th>Sintering parameters</th>
<th>RD (%)</th>
<th>Grain size (μm)</th>
<th>Contiguity</th>
<th>Matrix volume fraction</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-2Fe-1Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>36</td>
<td>0.42</td>
<td>0.34</td>
<td>[62]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W-4.9Ni-1.4Fe-0.7Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.55</td>
<td>0.22</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-3.5Ni-1Fe-0.5Co</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>0.73</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-3Fe</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>0.51 ± 0.2</td>
<td>14.3 ± 3.3</td>
<td>[46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-6Ni-2Fe-Co</td>
<td>1470 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>47</td>
<td>0.62 ± 0.2</td>
<td>15.2 ± 2.1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-5.6Ni-1.4Fe</td>
<td>1485 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.9</td>
<td>34.5</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[10]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe</td>
<td>1480 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>56</td>
<td>0.53 ± 0.05</td>
<td>0.14</td>
<td>[63]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Co</td>
<td>1480 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>0.43 ± 0.01</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>W-Ni-Fe-Re</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>0.48 ± 0.06</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W-4.9Ni-2.1Fe</td>
<td>1520 °C (1.5h)</td>
<td>99.1</td>
<td>45.5</td>
<td>0.32 ± 0.04</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-2.8Ni-1.2Fe-Al2O3</td>
<td>1520 °C (1.5h)</td>
<td>98.2</td>
<td>36.8</td>
<td>0.60 ± 0.06</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INERMET® IT180b**</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[64]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>95W-3.5Ni-1.5Cu</td>
<td>1510 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[65]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96W-3Ni-1Cu</td>
<td>1510 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>98.4</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>-</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-4xNi-xCo</td>
<td>1600 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99.2</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[45]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Conventional WHA**</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>40 - 60</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>-</td>
<td>[9]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>96W-4.56Ni-1.14Fe-Y2O3</td>
<td>1485 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>99</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>0.75</td>
<td>0.112</td>
<td>[53]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0</td>
<td>1400 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>99.5 ± 0.1</td>
<td>41 ± 2</td>
<td>0.53 ± 0.03</td>
<td>0.37 ± 0.015</td>
<td>Current study</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA0.75</td>
<td>1400 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>99.3 ± 0.1</td>
<td>37 ± 2</td>
<td>0.47 ± 0.03</td>
<td>0.42 ± 0.023</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*a* Maximal sintering temperature and duration time

b* Heavy tungsten alloy reported in [64]

c* Microstructure and properties of the heavy tungsten alloy are not known.
Fig. 10 Relationship between tungsten grain size and oxide particle size in ODS-WHAs reported in the current and past studies

The grain size of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particle-dispersion-strengthened WHAs described in this study was also compared with that in WHAs sintered using different methods (Table 4). The factors responsible for a fine original tungsten grain size ($G_0$) also contributed to grain refinement; the relationship between $G_0$ and refined grain size is as follows [61],

$$G^3 = G_0^3 + Kt$$

(8)

where $G$ is the mean W grain size at time $t$, $G_0$ is the original average W grain size at the onset of coarsening, and $K$ is the rate constant.

In this study, MA was conducted to produce small W particles. Internal defects caused by the significant strain on these particles due to the high impact forces generated during ball milling serve as additional nucleation sites for strain-free grains and homogenise the grain size [66]. Fan et al. [67] indicated that the powders obtained by MA affected the mechanism of sintering and contributed to fine tungsten grains in heavy alloys.

The alloys listed in Table 4 exhibited large and coarse grains as the sintering temperature increased (>1400 °C). As sintering is a diffusion-controlled process, alloys sintered at higher temperatures exhibit higher sintering and coarsening rates [68]. Moreover, high-temperature sintering results in a constant flow of the binder
phase through pores between W grains [48] and increases the final relative sintering
density. The alloys described in this study exhibit a high RD comparable with the RD
of alloys reported in the literature (Table 4). This is because the high pressure applied
during sintering accelerates W atom diffusion [69,70]. In addition, the oxide particles
also enhance the densifications process and decrease the porosity by capturing the
oxygen in the matrix.

3.4 Mechanical properties of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ alloys

Uniaxial tensile tests were conducted to measure the ultimate tensile strength (UTS)
of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ at room temperature (27 °C). The engineering stress–engineering
strain curves of the fabricated WHAs in current research were shown in Fig. 11a). From Fig. 11a), as the mass fraction of Zr(Y)O₂ increases from 0 to 0.75%, the
ultimate tensile strength and fracture strain of WHAs decrease linearly. The fracture
strain of WHAs decreases from 0.221 to 0.039. WHA₀ possesses the highest ultimate
tensile strength 937 MPa. When the mass fraction of Zr(Y)O₂ reaches to 0.25%, 0.50% and 0.75%, the ultimate tensile strengths of WHA₀.25, WHA₀.50 and WHA₀.75
were 906 MPa, 875 MPa and 782 MPa, respectively. The alloys exhibit the brittle
material behaviour in tension, compared to the pure tungsten with ductile material
behaviour. The comparison of the tensile mechanical properties of heavy tungsten
alloys with different sintering processes is summarised in Table 5. The ultimate
tensile strengths of WHA₀ and WHA₀.25 exhibit higher strengths compared to state of
the art.

Fig. 11c)–f) show the fracture surfaces of the failed tensile samples of
90W-7Ni-3Fe (90WHA) [9], 90W-7Ni-3Fe-0.04Y₂O₃ (90WHA-0.04Y₂O₃) [9],
WHA₀ and WHA₀.25, respectively. As shown in Fig. 11c) and d), W-W intergranular
rupture is the dominant mode of fracture in 90WHA. However, a few W grain
transgranular fractures and pore surfaces are still observed in 90WHA-0.04Y₂O₃.
Although the strength of present WHA₀ and WHA₀.25 alloy is lower than that of the
90WHA-0.04Y₂O₃ alloy, WHA₀ and WHA₀.25 shows visual evidence of W-W
cleavage patterns and the ductile failure behaviour of the matrix. This contradictory
situation would be researched in follow-up studies.

From these results, it may be inferred that oxide particles have a significant effect on the mechanical properties of the tested alloys. Too low or too high content of rare earth oxide additions would result in its different strengthening effect on tensile properties. Fan et al. [9] reported that WHAs with 0.4 wt.% oxide particles exhibited a tensile strength of 1124 MPa. In contrast, the additions of 0.1 wt.%, 0.8 wt.% Y₂O₃ into alloy decreased the maximal strength value of the alloy compared to WHA without Y₂O₃ (923 MPa). Lee et al. fabricated PSZ (0–0.3wt.%) dispersion-strengthened WHAs [51]; the ultimate tensile strengths of these alloys decreased with the addition of PSZ particles (as indicated by the red symbols in Fig. 11b)). A similar phenomenon occurred with the addition of 1% Al₂O₃ and 0.1% Y₂O₃ [10,52]. In these two alloys, the additions of oxide particles both decrease the strength values of WHAs. This indicates that a non-optimal oxide content deteriorates the tensile properties of alloys.

In addition to the oxide content, the mechanical properties of alloys depend on oxide particle distribution. In case oxide particles are agglomerated, fracture initiation might occur from these areas during tensile tests. Cracks are generated at these spots and later propagate, leading to fracture [78,79]. Moreover, rare earth oxide aggregates in the matrix or at the W-M interface restrain matrix deformation, which decreases the strength and elongation of WHAs.
Fig. 11 Tensile properties and fracture surfaces of WHAs and ODS-WHAs described in the present work and literature. a) engineering stress-engineering strain curve of the fabricated WHAs in current research, b) ultimate tensile strengths of WHAs and ODS-WHAs vs. their sintering temperature, c) fracture surfaces of 90WHA [9], d) 90WHA-0.04Y_2O_3 [9], e) WHA₀ and f) WHA₀.25.

Table 5 An extensive literature review of the tensile mechanical properties of heavy tungsten alloys coupled with various sintering processes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloys</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>UTS (MPa)</th>
<th>Elongation (%)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>92W-5.6Ni-2.4Fe</td>
<td>1400 °C (-)</td>
<td>975</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>[71]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90.5W-7.1Ni-1.65Fe-0.5Co-0.25Mo</td>
<td>1460 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>608</td>
<td>2.0</td>
<td>[73]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-3Fe</td>
<td>1460 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>650</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>[46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-6Ni-2Fe-2Co^{a}</td>
<td>1470 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>682</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>[46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-6Ni-2Fe-2Co^{b}</td>
<td>1470 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>816</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>[46]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90W-7Ni-3Fe</td>
<td>1480 °C (0.5 h)</td>
<td>923</td>
<td>8.0</td>
<td>[9]</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The compressive properties of WHAs reinforced with different amounts of Zr(Y)O₂ particles were investigated and compared as shown in Fig. 12. The engineering stress-strain curves and the corresponding true stress-strain curves of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ were plotted at room temperature (27 °C) (Fig. 12a) and b), respectively. During compressive testing, elastic deformation occurs initially with a linear relationship between stress and strain, followed by plastic deformation in the alloy. Beyond an engineering strain of 0.813, stress increased while the strain remained constant, as shown in Fig. 12a). This indicates the high plasticity of WHAs.

The matrix phase of WHAs is softer than the tungsten phase, which determines the plastic deformation capacity of the alloys during quasi-static compression. In the alloys described in the present study, the matrix phase containing a solid Zr(Y)O₂ particles was investigated and compared as shown in Fig. 12. The engineering stress-strain curves and the corresponding true stress-strain curves of WHA-Zr(Y)O₂ were plotted at room temperature (27 °C) (Fig. 12a) and b), respectively). During compressive testing, elastic deformation occurs initially with a linear relationship between stress and strain, followed by plastic deformation in the alloy. Beyond an engineering strain of 0.813, stress increased while the strain remained constant, as shown in Fig. 12a). This indicates the high plasticity of WHAs.
phase exhibited good plasticity. This is due to the fact that some nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were uniformly distributed in the matrix with a good interface. These ultrafine oxide particles reduced stress and strain concentration during compressive deformation [80].

Based on the true stress-strain curves in Fig. 12b), the WHA containing 0.5% Zr(Y)O$_2$ exhibited the best strengthening behaviour among all the tested alloys. The ultimate compressive strength of WHA$_{0.50}$ was 1445 MPa, which was higher than that of the other three alloys. Furthermore, we observed that the ultimate compressive strength obtained during plastic deformation is affected by the strain rate; to illustrate this phenomenon, we tested the alloy samples at strain rates of $10^{-3}$, $10^{-2}$, $10^{-1}$, and 1 s$^{-1}$, as shown in Fig. 13.

Fig. 13a) indicates that WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ exhibited excellent plasticity at different strain rates. The ultimate stress increased with an increase in the strain rate, as shown in Fig. 13b). An ultimate stress of 1445 MPa was achieved at $10^{-3}$ s$^{-1}$. The compressive strength of WHA$_{0.50}$ was higher than that of several previously reported alloys, as shown in Fig. 13c). The comparison of the compressive strength value of heavy tungsten alloys with different sintering processes is summarised in Table 6. The ultimate compressive strength of WHA$_{0.50}$ was 1445 MPa, which exhibits higher strength compared to state of the art. This higher value of strength may be due to the proper amount of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles and higher dispersed nanoparticles distribution. When the strain rate increases to 1 s$^{-1}$, the peak stress increases to 1560 MPa. On the one hand, a high strain rate enhances dislocation density and work hardening. On the other hand, the change of phase’ deformation behaviors may be another main reason. The deformed microstructures produced at different strain rates are shown to illustrate the plastic deformation behaviour of WHA-Zr(Y)O$_2$ (Fig. 14a–d)).

During compression, the matrix phase is the first to deform. When tests are conducted at low strain rates, the matrix phase has sufficient time to deform and flow between tungsten particles, as confirmed by the slightly elongated microstructure of tungsten grains in Fig. 14a). With the further increasing of plastic deformation, the matrix phase causes work hardening by plastic deformation, which induces a
simultaneous deformation in some tungsten particles. The deformation resistance of the matrix phase depends on the oxide particles used to reinforce it. When the strain rate during compression increases, there is not enough time for the matrix phase to flow between W particles, owing to which it gradually transmits stress to W grains, leading to their deformation. Beyond a critical strain rate, the deformation resistance of the alloy mainly depends on the tungsten phase. Therefore, W particles were seriously elongated at 1 s⁻¹, as shown in Fig. 14d).

Fig. 12 a) Room temperature (27 °C) engineering stress-strain curves and b) true stress-strain curves of WHAs with different mass fractions of Zr(Y)O₂. Compression tests were conducted at a constant strain rate of 10⁻³ s⁻¹.
Fig. 13 a) Room temperature (27 °C) engineering stress-strain curves and b) true stress-strain curves of WHA₀.₅₀ generated during compression tests at different strain rates. c) Comparison of the compressive true stress-strain curve of WHA₀.₅₀ with those of previously reported alloys.

Table 6 An extensive literature review of the compressive strength value of heavy tungsten alloys coupled with various sintering processes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Alloys</th>
<th>Sintering process</th>
<th>Compressive strength (MPa)</th>
<th>Ref.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>95W–2.8Ni–1.2Fe–1Al₂O₃</td>
<td>1525 °C (1.5 h)</td>
<td>1400</td>
<td>[52]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>93W–5.6 Ni–1.4 Fe</td>
<td>1410 °C (-)</td>
<td>1380</td>
<td>[81]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>90 W–7Ni–3Fe</td>
<td>1490 °C (1 h)</td>
<td>1150</td>
<td>[82]</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WHA₀.₅₀</td>
<td>1400 °C (2 h)</td>
<td>1445</td>
<td>Current research</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fig. 14 Microstructure of WHA$_{0.75}$ after compression tests at room temperature ($27 \, ^\circ$C) at strain rates of a) $10^{-3}$, b) $10^{-2}$, c) $10^{-1}$, and d) $1 \, s^{-1}$

4. Conclusion

(1) WHAs strengthened by highly uniform nanosized Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles were fabricated by hydrothermal processing followed by MA and hot isostatic pressing.

(2) Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles bonded well with the tungsten phase; they were smaller than 200 nm in size and were distributed uniformly in tungsten grains and the matrix. TEM analysis indicated the presence of a large number of nanosized oxide particles smaller than 50 nm in the alloy microstructure.

(3) The size of Zr(Y)O$_2$ particles synthesised using combined hydrothermal and MA methods is much smaller than that in alloys previously reported; this small size also helped in tungsten grain refinement.
The ultimate tensile and maximal compressive strengths of the fabricated alloys under quasi-static deformation at room temperature (27 °C) were 906 and 1445 MPa, respectively, which are much higher than the values reported in literature. The ultimate tensile strength and fracture strain of WHAs decrease with the mass fraction of Zr(Y)O₂ (from 0 to 0.75%). The alloys exhibit the brittle material behaviour in tension, compared to the pure tungsten with ductile material behaviour. The effect of Zr(Y)O₂ particles and strain rate on the compressive properties of the alloys were investigated in detail and the corresponding compressive deformation mechanisms were discussed.

Declaration of interest
There are no conflicts to declare.

Acknowledgments
National Natural Science Foundation of China [No. U2004180, No. 51874185] and Graduate Research and Innovation & Practice Projects in Jiangsu Province, China [No. KYCX19_0182]. The EIPHI Graduate School (contract ANR-17-EURE-0002), also has supported this work.

References


[3] Y. Yu, H. Hu, W. Zhang, X. Xu, Microstructure evolution and recrystallization after annealing of tungsten heavy alloy subjected to severe plastic deformation, J.


